

---

## MINUTES OF ENVIRONMENT STRATEGIC POLICY COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 26<sup>th</sup> SEPTEMBER 2018

---

1. Minutes of the meeting held 27<sup>th</sup> June 2018.

**Order: Agreed**

2. Matters arising

Ciaran McGoldrick updated the members on outstanding reports as set out below

Outstanding reports - Dublin City Council

- (i) Dublin Waste to Energy re-financing Report

**This report is in the Agenda Pack (CMcG)**

- (ii) Waste Categorisation report.

**This report remains unavailable (CMcG)**

- (iii) Eastern and Midland Region Waste Office Annual report

**This is an Agenda Item for this meeting and will be dealt with by Hugh Coughlan. (CMcG)**

Outstanding reports – Irish Water

- (I) Report on Water Conservation Awareness Campaign to issue to the Committee

- (II) Report on water savings where rain water harvesting was installed to issue to the Committee

- (III) Details on Thames costing figures to issue to the Committee provided they are not commercially sensitive.

- (IV) Data behind graphs in the presentations to issue to the Committee

**Items (I), (III) and (IV) have been requested from Irish Water and I have been advised by Irish Water that they will issue in the near future. (CMcG)**

**Item (II) issued to the Committee yesterday. (CMcG)**

Items requested at the Special Meeting on 25<sup>th</sup> May 2018:

- (i) Documentation in relation to the Special Meeting on Commissioning to go up on the Council website

**This data has been placed on the Environment SPC webpage. The data is in zip format as the webpage cannot cater for more than 60mb of data and in unzipped format there is in excess of 130mb of data (CMcG)**

- (ii) Copy of the HZI document, Function and Design Specification on the Net Calorific Value (NCV) calculation

**This report is in the Agenda Pack (CMcG)**

- (iii) Report on the Powder Activated Carbon recirculation

**This is referenced in the Dublin Waste to Energy update report (CMcG)**

- (iv) Report on the software failures at the plant

**Report from Dublin Waste to Energy Limited is in the Agenda Pack (CMcG)**

- (v) Definition of the cell values for the power figures in the Excel spreadsheets

**Cell value definitions are referenced in the Dublin Waste to Energy update report (CMcG)**

Members raised the following queries / issues in relation to Matter Arising

- Fail to understand why Irish Water are so slow on the reports requested (COM)
- Can the rain water harvesting report be relisted for a future meeting (CC)
- Received the Agenda documentation on time and the minutes are good (JMcc)
- The rainwater harvesting report is fascinating but it is out of date. The report issued in 2005. It is from a time when there was no charge for domestic water; the finances and the analysis on the return on rainwater harvesting is poor. (JMcc)
- Suggest that it is not (the rainwater harvesting report) worth spending time on, a modern report is required (JMcc)
- A document describing rainwater harvesting policy in Ireland is required (JMcc)
- Cell definitions and all 62 data points is required (JMcc)
- Waste categorisation report is still outstanding (JMcc)
- The standing item on our Agenda, Dublin Waste to Energy is item 11, it should be Item 5 or 6. Having it so far down the Agenda may preclude the committee from having sufficient time to debate this item. It would be appreciated if the Dublin Waste to Energy could be moved back up the agenda to where it should be (JMcc)

In relation to the final bullet, the Chair advised that the Agenda will proceed as listed, it is his role to set the Agenda but consideration will be given to Mr. McCarthy's request in the future.

**Order: Noted**

The Chair referenced the correspondence from Member, Joe McCarthy.

**Order: Noted**

4. Chairperson's Business

**None.**

5. Eastern and Midland Region Waste Office Annual report 2017. – Hugh Coughlan, Regional Co-ordinator

Members thanked Hugh for the report that issued and raised the following questions / issues.

- It is unfortunate that so much waste is being exported (MF)
- Social Housing Complexes are not being given adequate recycling facilities. Perhaps the Chair will visit some of the complexes to view the situation (MF)
- Recycling in Social Housing Complexes does not seem to be gaining any momentum. (MF)
- Illegal dumping continues to be a problem, particularly in the North Inner City; numbers of fines issued are low (CC)
- Members of the public do not receive responses when reporting illegal dumping (CC)
- More staff with sweeping brushes are required, mechanical sweepers do not collect all the litter particularly when cars are parked (CC)
- Parking and Street Cleaning should be coordinated (CC)
- The current sizes of waste collection bins available do not suit everyone's requirements, smaller bins are required. Can we require Waste Management Companies to provide smaller sizes bins (CC)
- Do we know where the exported waste is going or is it just being sent to a market in the UK and then out of sight out of mind (CC)
- Will kerbside waste collections arrive at the EU recycling targets (CC)
- A deposit refund scheme should be introduced (PEP, aluminium, paper etc.) (CC)
- More litter wardens are required (COM)
- Have there been any prosecutions in relation to tyre dumping (COM)
- The mattress initiative in Ringsend was a fantastic initiative, can this be replicated on the Northside (COM)
- We should be doing a lot more in relation to plastic waste. (cc)
- The statistics in the Annual report are from 2015 (JMCC)
- The report suggests that the statistics are available on the EMWR website, there are no statistics on the website, (JMCC)
- It would be helpful if we could have 2016 / 17 statistics even if they are not validated (JMCC)
- I am disappointed with the lack of figures in the report (JMCC)
- The sealing of litter bins during the Pope's visit caused a lot of litter. (MF)
- There does not appear to be any enforcement in relation to cigarette litter outside public houses, are there any statistics on this. (MF)
- It is likely that construction waste will increase exponentially, what is the plan in relation to our capacity for processing it (NOM)

Hugh Coughlan and Simon Brock responded

- There is a pilot project at an apartment complex, Northwood in Santy where recycling and segregation is being trialled. If successful, the template may be used for other complexes. (HC)
- Recycling in apartment complexes and social housing complexes is key to achieving EU recycling targets (HC)
- The bye laws currently going through stages of Council have provisions to address illegal dumping (HC)
- We can reissue a report on waste exportation that was previously issued (HC)
- It is not clear if on street deposit refund scheme would work but Repak is considering piloting this in certain instances. The viability needs to be assessed (HC)
- A staff member from waste management has been assigned to work with the Housing Department to assess the recycling situation in Flat Complexes (SB)
- Low cost battery operated CCTV is being examined to combat illegal dumping. (SB)
- Collaboration with the North Inner City Task force is ongoing in relation to multi-let properties. (SB)
- Areas prone to dumping have been “greened” and taken over by communities (SB)
- Enforcement services are currently being reviewed as the level of fines and success rate is not good enough. (SB)
- Cleaning around parked cars is resource intensive, mechanical cleaning enables a greater area to be covered. We have successful arrangements in place with a number of communities where cars are moved on the scheduled cleaning days. (SB)
- There is capacity for the processing of clean stone and soils the problem is with mildly contaminated material which can only go to lined landfill. Most of this is going for export. In conjunction with the EPA the development of bespoke facilities for this material is being examined (HC)
- Peer review is currently being undertaken to identify the best solution for the mildly contaminated C & D waste (HC)
- The EPA provides the EMWR with the data, 2015 is the most up to date validated data set. (HC)
- Waste arisings are monitored on an ongoing basis, the regional office gets figures from the facilities on a quarterly basis but this is not validated (HC)
- The data used for the 2015 plan was 2012 figures. (HC)
- We are planning to review the waste arisings projection model this year (HC)
- We are hoping to have the report soon and the back-up statistics will be on the website. (HC)
- Only bins on the Pope’s route were sealed (SB)

**Order: Report Noted. Published version of the Annual Report to issue to Members when available**

(i) Climate Change Action Plan Update Report – Dr. Gerry Wardell, CODEMA

Members raised the following questions / issues in relation to the report that was circulated.

- The biosphere, in particular St Anne's Park is very important for North Dublin. (COM)
- The grass on the Brent geese feeding grounds has not been cut, can a letter issue from this committee to the developer requesting the grass is cut (COM)
- There is a need for meaningful public participation in the preparation of the action plan (CC)
- It is important that the plan is developed in partnership with the communities that we serve (CC)
- How are we going to involve people in this plan (CC)
- I hope there is a very active public participation in the plan (CC)
- A special meeting to deal specifically with the Climate Change Action Plan can be arranged (NOM)
- To invite people to participate in a document that is already written is problematic (MF)
- Are we conflating the national dialogue with the local dialogue, are they 2 separate processes (CC)

Ms Céline Reilly / Dr. Gerry Wardell responded.

- The plan will go to public consultation in January (CR)
- There will be a national dialogue held in Dublin in the first quarter 2019. (CR)
- It is intended to hold a consultation event where stakeholders and the public are invited (CR)
- What Councillor Cuffe is suggesting is not dissimilar to what is proposed for the new year which will inform the public consultation and the plan further (CR)
- The national and local dialogues are 2 separate processes (CR)
- The public and stakeholders will be invited to the dialogue (CR)
- There will be separate consultation for the City's Action Plan (CR)

**Order: Report Noted.**

(ii) Dublin Metropolitan Climate Action Regional Office – Céline Reilly, Executive Manager

**Order: Report Noted. Letter to issue to developer**

7. Biodiversity Presentation – Niamh Ní Cholmain, Biodiversity Facilitator

The Chair advised the Committee that this item is as a result of a request from Robert Moss.

**Order: Presentation Noted**

8. Herbicide Policy Motion

"That this Committee adopts the attached Dublin City Council Herbicide Use Policy"

The Chair advised the Committee as set out below.

- At a previous meeting of the SPC it was agreed that this Committee would develop a motion in support on the eradication of glyphosate usage.
- The Chair and Robert Moss met with Les Moore, Parks Dept. who prepared a herbicide policy which is in the Agenda Pack.
- The CPG has endorsed the policy
- The Housing and Roads Departments use significant amounts of herbicide.

Members made the following observations in relation to the motion

- In light of the court case in the US where an individual's cancer was attributed to use of Glyphosate it must be phased out (CC)
- Not happy with use of Glyphosate Like to see it phased out (CC)
- We must accept that we are dealing with a poison (MF)
- We should begin a programme to develop a natural environment (MF)
- The herbicides can ruin Dublin's natural wild life (MF)
- DCC should support the use of alternative weed killers (COM)
- Glyphosate should not be used at all, weeds should be pulled by hand (JMCC)
- The underlying economics of Roundup, it is pushed by Monsanto who promote GM crops. (JMCC)
- It is a vicious circle of intervention in nature which is beneficial to the chemical company (JMCC)
- DCC should have a policy that obviates the use of Glyphosate (JMCC)
- DCC carried out weed removal in Stoneybatter using various methods of weed removal, what were the results (JMCC)

**Order: Motion Carried. Report on trials carried out on the use of non- herbicide products in Stoneybatter to issue to the Committee.**

9. Litter Management Plan 2016 -2018 update report – Simon Brock Administrative Officer.

Members raised the following questions / issues in relation to the report that was circulated.

- The removal of chewing gum from pavements leaves clean stains (spots) (MF)
- Is there a contribution from the industry to cover the costs of chewing gum removal. (MF)
- Amount of cigarette litter emanating from public houses (MF)
- Raheny Tidy Towns are doing a fantastic job; people tend not to litter when an area is litter free. The public houses clean up last thing at night and first thing in the morning. (COM)
- Are there measures in place to control bonfire material (EM)
- Can underground glass recycling be piloted within the next 12 months.(CC)

Simon Brock responded

- Chewing gum removal is carried out overnight as it is the most efficient and safest time for this activity
- The whole street is not power cleaned during chewing gum removal, this would lead to a substantial cost increase.
- The industry contributes to the annual chewing gum campaign

- We had a cigarette butt awareness campaign earlier this year.
- Cigarette litter is a serious issue Like to see it phased out (CC)
- Like to see it phased out (CC)
- An enforcement and awareness campaign was carried out with public houses in the city centre area. A number of fines issued which were cancelled if premises were able to demonstrate compliance.
- Plans are in place to facilitate the removal of bonfire material

**Order report: Noted. Piloting of underground glass recycling facilities to be examined.**

10. Dublin Waste to Energy – James Nolan, Senior Executive Officer

Members raised the following questions

- Can we have definitions of the cell values for the power figures in the Excel spreadsheets (JMCC)
- The power generation report was to clarify the discrepancy between 67.5 megawatts being produced and 55.8 megawatts produced during the performance demonstration test. It would be helpful if a figure could be provided from the DCS showing how 67.5 megawatts is being produced (JMCC)
- We require a report on the power capabilities of the plant, what is the plate power of the turbine, what is produced by the turbine. There is no supporting evidence to show 67.5 megawatts is being produced. (JMCC)
- DWtE Ltd. Applied to An Bord Pleanála to increase the capacity of the plant by 90,000 tonnes, this was subsequently withdrawn (JMCC)
- The plant is operating at 10% above the permitted capacity. In the last quarter reported 164,800 tonnes of material was processed (JMCC)
- There is a concern 60,000 tonnes more than permitted is being processed (JMCC)
- There was an exceedance of a waste stream EWC901212; Covanta have asked for this waste stream to be increased from 10,000 tonnes to 100,000 tonnes. So far 42,000 tonnes of this waste stream has been processed which is in excess of the 10,000 tonnes allowed – A non-compliance notice has issued in relation to this. (JMCC)
- The plant accepted waste from a company offering 2 bin waste collection services, it must accept waste from companies offering 3 bin collections (JMCC)
- Covanta has applied to accept pharmaceutical sludge – this type of waste is not permitted (JMCC)
- Can I have clarification on the pharmaceutical sludge and if 10% above the permitted capacity is being processed (JMCC)
- It is difficult to drill down to find out what is going on (in the plant) from the reports provided (CC)
- We need to know what types of material are being processed by the facility (CC)
- Is green bin waste being processed by the facility (CC)
- Covanta are arguing (with the EPA) that they cannot be held responsible for another operator's actions (JMCC)
- It is likely that the material returned from China (green recyclables) will go to incineration if it is badly contaminated (JMCC)

- An increase of 90,000 tonnes in the capacity of the facility would be hugely profitable – it would cover the running cost of the plant (JMCC)
- We will know in January the exact amount processed (JMCC)

James Nolan responded.

- Definitions for the other 59 cells will be provided
- Under normal operation, since commissioning 67.50 megawatts is being produced with an internal load of c7 megawatts and a nett of c60 megawatts.
- It is a non-hazardous facility and it cannot accept hazardous sludge.
- The facility has an annual capacity of 600,000 tonnes, owing to downtimes there will be monthly fluctuations in the amount of material being processed.
- On an annual basis the facility will treat no more than 600,000 tonnes.
- The licence allows for the processing of 500,000 tonnes of municipal waste and 100,000 tonnes of Industrial Commercial Waste.
- EWC191212 – that code is for pre-treated waste it can be household waste
- The EPA is the statutory body responsible for managing and enforcing the licence; the EPA has issued a non-compliance notice which shows the system works.
- The case (Ray Whelan) was not offering a brown bin collection service this company was issued with a non-compliance notice for not offering a 3 bin service and DWtE Ltd was issued with a non-compliance for accepting the material; this also shows that the system works
- We have not seen the report yet, is a matter for the EPA and the operator.
- The plant is not treating plastics material

**Order: Noted**

(i) Incidents and Non Compliances

Members raised the following issues in relation to incidents and non-compliances

- The plant ran under temperature owing to storm Emma. (JMCC)
- The EPA wants a report from the operator identifying emergency situations which have implications for safe operation in the event of power loss, can the Committee have this report as the plant failed for an extended period of 1 – 1.5 days. (JMCC)
- From information received under FOI from the HSA in relation to the flue gas residue spill incident; Flue Gas Treatment Residue has accumulated that it exceeded the level of the manholes in the plant and Material spilled out of all 12 manholes (JM)
- Safety showers and eye washers were available but were not used (JMCC)
- The ambulance was not called and workers went to St. Vincent's hospital by private car (JMCC)
- The material that was analysed by SGS Laboratory showed some contamination (heavy metals, dioxins) and a copy of this report has been requested. (JMCC)

**Order: Noted. Further report to issue on why the Dublin Fire Brigade Emergency Services were not used after the lime spill incident.**

(ii) Software response from Dublin Waste to Energy

Members raised the following issues in relation to the response (from DwtE Ltd.) that was circulated.

- The software report does not refer to the following which were notified to the EPA
  - (i) A report from AWN on 12<sup>th</sup> January stating that the valve controlling the recirculated residue had its maximum set point accidentally changed during software modifications (JMCC)
  - (ii) On June 20<sup>th</sup> January 2017, the root cause analysis stated that the set point was reset during the DCS logic (software) download (JMCC)
  - (iii) The site visit report by the EPA on 14<sup>th</sup> December, an incorrect logic in the burner control programme caused the incident (JMCC)
  - (iv) On September 7<sup>th</sup>, the plant trip was a result of a logic change download which caused the boiler drum level control to trip which shut down the plant (JMCC)
  - (v) The vendor of the sea water pump station was working on the logic and took the pump water level signal away causing a trip. (JMCC)

#### **Order Noted**

(iii) Dublin Waste to Energy Re-financing report

Members raised the following issues in relation to the report that was circulated.

- It was a surprise to see that DDC got c.€8m as part of the refinancing (JMCC)
- The refinancing report requested was meant to address what has happened to the ownership of the plant. ~ (JMCC)
- The ownership of the plant was restructured substantially; who owns the plant now (JMCC)

James Nolan responded.

- The refinancing and restructuring are 2 different matters
- The refinancing is the refinancing of the debt associated with the project which the report deals with.
- The company is a 50 / 50 joint venture between Covanta and Green Investment Group

#### **Order: Noted**

(iv) HZI - NCV Waste calculation

#### **Order: Noted**

(v) Q2 Environmental Report 2018 to EPA

Order: **Report Noted**

11. Dublin District Heating Systems, Victor Coe, Senior Executive Engineer

Members thanked Victor for the presentation and raised the following questions / issues

- Is it not remiss of DCC to not have District Heating in place at the same time as the DWtE facility became operational. (COM)
- A large amount of heat energy is being wasted (COM)
- What will be the kilowatt / hour cost for the heat (JMCC)
- Are energy stations boilers (JMCC)
- The representation does not specifically state that the principal source of heat will be the DWtE facility, I presume this is the case (JMCC)
- What is the value of the contract with Ramboll (JMCC)
- Does the high level design for the Poolbeg SDZ provide for connection to the District Heating System (JMCC)
- There was substantial investment in bring pipework to Spencer Dock can the amount be confirmed, who owns this infrastructure and will it be part of the District Heating Scheme (JMCC)
- Where will the energy station (s) be located (MF)
- Can you confirm that the model being proposed is that DCC will own the infrastructure and an operator will be brought in to run the system (NOM)
- We know what the retail costs of heat from electrical and gas companies are, is there any commercial value in running a district heating system (JMCC)
- We don't want a situation to arise that a long term contract is entered into with clauses that that wind up the cost of the lifetime of the contract (JMCC)
- Is there a business case for District Heating (JMCC)

Victor Coe & Dick Brady responded

- It is likely that the energy stations will be located on the Port Company's land (VC)
- Many of the buildings in the Docklands, e.g. the Central Bank are district heating enabled. (VC)
- The fact that the District Heating Scheme must go commercial straight away cannot test itself on a Local Authority redevelopment; this makes the project more complicated (VC)
- The pipework infrastructure in the Docklands belongs to DCC (VC)
- The developers of the SDZ have the pipework for District Heating included in the plans (VC)
- The value of the Ramboll contract is €150,000.00 (VC)
- The energy station will encompass the equipment needed to run the District Heating Network (VC)
- The unit cost of the heat has not been agreed yet, negotiations are ongoing with Covanta (VC)
- The energy station will be about 1,500 sq. metres in size (VC)
- The commercial model is being teased out with the NDFA (VC)
- We must arrive at a cost per unit of heat that can directly compete with electricity and gas, in fact the cost will have to come in below gas (DB)
- There is excitement amongst the business community for this project to go ahead (DB)
- We are up against time to ensure the project can merge with Poolbeg SDZ. (DB)

**Order: Presentation Noted. When Business Model clarified report to issue to the Committee. Progress report to issue to future meeting of the Committee**

12. Motion referred from the South East Area Committee:

*That this area committee calls on the manager to make the following changes to tackle litter in the South East Area:*

- 1. Employ more good old-fashioned street sweepers as our numbers of front-line staff are down 20% since 2012.*
- 2. Increase the frequency of litter bin emptying and place the emptying rota on the side of the bin along with a Freephone number and email address in case of problems.*
- 3. Encourage litter reporting via the @DubCityCouncil Twitter feed or a new Dublin City Litter Twitter and Facebook account.*
- 4. Reinststate the schedule on the Dublin City Council website that showed whether streets were cleaned daily, weekly or monthly.*
- 5. Require the double bagging of commercial waste in areas prone to seagull attacks.*
- 6. Instruct waste companies to provide smaller bins or caddies to smaller households and older people so that they have an easy-to-use alternative to wheelie bins.*
- 7. Reform our parking regulations working with the Department of Transport so that we can restrict parking on one side of the street on one day a month to allow our street cleaning trucks to make a clean sweep of roadsides.*
- 8. Improve our illegal dumping CCTV so that the batteries are solar charged, and the imagery is sent wirelessly to our offices instead of requiring mobile cranes to insert batteries and download images.*
- 9. Make greater use of CCTV warning signs and blurred image from CCTV to discourage littering.*
- 10. Ensure that the QR codes system on our litter bins is fully operational so that the public can report full or graffitied bins.*
- 11. Distribute two free 'pooper-scooper bags' envelopes and an information leaflet when people apply for or renew their dog license, and increase the amount of bins for dog waste.*
- 12. Better publicise the Dublin City Council Litter hotline 1800 248 348 and email [southeast@dublincity.ie](mailto:southeast@dublincity.ie) and ensure that litter complaints made by email or new media are responded to once tackled.*

**Order: Motion sent for report to next future meeting of the SPC.**

13. AOB

- (i) Motion in the name of Councillor Paddy Smyth

To amend the council's litter bye-laws to prohibit the use of council property (i.e. street furniture and lamp-posts) for the erection of election material/advertisements during the allotted period of time in which it is permissible to advertise election material under the below legislation (1-8) and instead allow each Local Area Committee to designate specific streets on which poster erection on council property would be permissible.

1. Litter Pollution Act 1997, amended by the Electoral (Amendment) (No. 2) Act 2009
2. Protection of the Environment Act 2003
3. Planning and Development Regulations 2001-2013

4. European Parliament Elections Act 1997
5. Local Elections Regulations 1995
6. Referendum Act 1994
7. Electoral Act 1992
8. Road Traffic Act 1961

Following debate, the motion was put to a vote, 1 member in favour, 1 abstention and 4 Members against the motion

**Order: Motion defeated**

- (ii) The Chair proposed that the November meeting should start at 2.30pm in order to deal with the specific topic of bathing water quality

**Order: Agreed**

In attendance

Members

Councillor Ciarán Cuffe  
Councillor Mannix Flynn  
Joe McCarthy, An Taisce  
Councillor Edel Moran  
Councillor Michael Mullooly  
Councillor Michael O'Brien  
Councillor Ciaran O'Moore  
Councillor Naoise Ó'Muirí

Apologies

Councillor Tina MacVeigh  
Councillor Claire Byrne  
Robert Moss, PPN

Absent

Councillor Declan Flanagan  
William Brennan, PPN  
Robert Colleran, PPN

Officials

Dick Brady, Assistant Chief Executive  
Céline Reilly, Executive Manager  
Les Moore, Parks and Landscape Division Superintendent  
James Nolan, Senior Executive Officer  
Hugh Coughlan, Regional Co-ordinator, Eastern and Midland Region Waste Office  
Eithne Gibbons, Senior Executive Officer  
Victor Coe, Senior Executive Engineer  
Niamh Ní Cholmain, Biodiversity Facilitator

Ciaran McGoldrick, A/Senior Staff Officer  
Ian Boggans, Assistant Staff Officer

Outside Bodies

Dr. Gerry Wardell, CODEMA  
Michelle Hallahan, PPN linkage group

**NAOISE Ó'MUIRÍ**  
**CHAIRPERSON, 28<sup>TH</sup> SEPTEMBER 2018**