

Quality Assurance Report for 2019

Dublin City Council

**Submitted to the National Oversight and Audit Commission in compliance with the Public
Spending Code**

28th August 2020

Certification

This Quality Assurance Report reflects Dublin City Council's assessment of compliance with the Public Spending Code. It is based on the best financial, organisational and performance related information available across the various areas of responsibilities.



Owen P. Keegan
Chief Executive

Dublin City Council

28th August 2020

Contents

1.0 Introduction

2.0 Expenditure Analysis

2.1 Project/Programme Inventory

2.2 Summary of procurements in excess of €10m

3.0 Assessment of Compliance

3.1 Checklists & Findings

3.2 In-depth Check

4.0 Addressing Quality Assurance Issues

5.0 Conclusion

Appendix 1 Project/Programme Inventory

Appendix 2 Completed Checklists

1.0 Introduction

Dublin City Council has completed this Quality Assurance (QA) Report as part of its ongoing compliance with the Public Spending Code (PSC). The Public Spending Code aims to ensure that the State achieves value for money in the use of public funds.

The report presents the results of each of the 5 steps of the QA process, as set out below, and aims to gauge the extent to which the Council is meeting the obligations set out in the Public Spending Code.

The Guidance Note issued to the Local Government Sector by the Finance Committee of the County and City Management Association has been used to complete the QA process in Dublin City Council.

The Quality Assurance process consists of 5 steps;

- **Step 1** – Drawing up the inventories of projects/programmes at different stages of the Project Life Cycle that have a total project cost in excess of €500,000. The three sections of the inventory are expenditure being considered, expenditure being incurred and expenditure recently ended.
- **Step 2** – Publish summary information on the City Council's web-site of all procurements in excess of €10m, related to projects in progress or completed in the year under review.
- **Step 3** - Completion of the 7 checklists contained in the Public Spending Code in respect of expenditure at the different stages. One of each checklist per Local Authority is required. Checklists are not required for each project/programme.
- **Step 4** – A more in-depth check of a small number of projects / programmes based on criteria established within the Public Spending Code.
- **Step 5** – Completion of a report for the National Oversight and Audit Commission (NOAC) which will be generated through compliance with steps 1 to 4 and to be submitted by the end of August in respect of the previous year.

2.0 Expenditure analysis

2.1 Project/Programme Inventory

The Project Inventory sets out the list of all projects with activity in 2019 and which have a total project life cost of €500,000 or more. As specified in the *PSC QA Requirements Guidance Note for the Public Sector*, capital projects which have been listed in previous PSC reports in the Expenditure Being Incurred category remain in this category year on year until the project is complete. The inventory is broken down into capital and current expenditure and consists of three categories:

- Expenditure being considered
- Expenditure being incurred
- Expenditure recently ended

As per the template provided to Dublin City Council, Capital Expenditure in the being considered category is further broken down into value bands of €0.5m - €5m, €5m-€20m and €20m plus.

The complete inventory is contained in **Appendix 1**.

The Inventory contains 303 projects across the three categories and is comprised of a total value of €3,319,042,929. The inventory was compiled using the format recommended in the guidance note from the CCMA. The list contains relevant services from the Council's Annual Financial Statement 2019 in respect of the current expenditure and a list of relevant capital projects/programmes extracted from the Council's Financial Management System, with information verified by project owners, for capital expenditure.

Summary of Project Inventory 2019

Number of Projects by Category

	Current Expenditure	Capital Expenditure Being Incurred and Recently Ended	Capital Expenditure being considered			Total
			€0.5-€5m	€5m-€20m	€20m plus	
No. of Projects						
Expenditure Being Considered			44	9	3	56
Expenditure Being Incurred	56	148				204
Expenditure Recently Ended		43				43
Total	56	191	44	9	3	303

Projects by Cost

	Current Expenditure	Capital Expenditure Being Incurred and Recently Ended	Capital Expenditure being considered			Total
			€0.5m-€5m	€5m-€20m	Over €20m	
Projects			€0.5m-€5m	€5m-€20m	Over €20m	
Expenditure Being Considered			91,021,426	97,262,244	94,500,000	282,783,670
Expenditure Being Incurred	975,141,000	1,868,532,050				2,843,673,050
Expenditure Recently Ended		192,586,209				192,586,209
Total	975,141,000	2,061,118,259	91,021,426	97,262,244	94,500,000	3,319,042,929

2.2 Summary of Procurements in excess of €10m

In compliance with Step 2 of the QA process, there were 14 procurements in excess of €10m which relate to projects which are included on the Inventory for 2019.

There were four procurements already listed that have been updated to reflect transactions in 2019.

All this information can be found on the DCC website at the following location;

<http://www.dublincity.ie/PublicSpendingCode> along with a copy of this report.

3.0 Assessment of Compliance

3.1 Checklists and Findings

Step 3 of the Quality Assurance process involved the compilation of a number of checklists, seven in total.

Checklist 1: General Obligations not specific to individual projects.

Checklist 2: Capital Projects under consideration.

Checklist 3: Current Expenditure under consideration.

Checklist 4: Capital Expenditure incurring expenditure

Checklist 5: Current Expenditure programmes incurring expenditure

Checklist 6: Capital Expenditure recently ended.

Checklist 7: Current Expenditure recently ended.

The completed checklists for Dublin City Council are contained in **Appendix 2**.

The checklists were completed based on checklists returned for a random selection of projects under each of the 3 categories, where appropriate, explanatory comments are provided, in addition to self-assessed scores.

For both capital and current expenditure, the checklists indicate a satisfactory level of compliance with the requirements of the PSC and there are indications that there is scope for further improvement in certain aspects. No serious issues or concerns were evident during the completion of this step of the QA process.

Checklist 1 indicates a high level of compliance with the PSC in terms of provision and development of appropriate guidelines and awareness in the organisation, with the addition of the establishment of a corporate governance structure for capital project expenditure and a Project Manager Network.

In relation to capital expenditure, **Checklist 2** shows a good level of compliance with the code and identifies areas of improvement in terms of establishing and gathering information on performance indicators. It is expected that improvement will continue through the Corporate Project Support Office and will lead to broad compliance with the code regarding performance indicators. **Checklists 4 and 6** show a satisfactory level of compliance. Improvements are still required regarding post projects reviews and these are being addressed through the corporate governance structure for capital projects, revised guidelines and the Corporate Project Support Office and related Project Manager Network.

3.2 In-depth Check

The PSC – QA requirements state that the value of projects selected for in-depth review each year should be at least 1% of the total value of revenue and 5% of the total capital value on the project inventory and can be achieved over a 3 year period. It also states that over a 3-5 year period all stages of the project life cycle and every scale of project should have been included in the in-depth check. The Internal Audit Unit addressed these requirements for 2019 by conducting in-depth checks into two capital projects and one that has both capital and revenue elements.

- In-depth check of Dalymount Park Redevelopment **Capital**
- In-depth check of the Delivery of Social Housing through Approved Housing Bodies, facilitated by Dublin City Council **Capital & Revenue**
- In-depth check of the Appraisal, Planning and Incurring Expenditure of the Phase 2 Volumetric Rapid Build Housing (Bundle 1) **Capital**

Dalymount Park Redevelopment Project is project at the *incurring* stage. The project has a budgeted capital spend of €35.6m.

Delivery of Social Housing through Approved Housing Bodies, facilitated by Dublin City Council is a project at *all stages* of spend, across a variety of projects and has a budgeted capital spend of €158.7m and a 2019 AHB Revenue Expense mostly included within Revenue Code A07 RAS and Leasing Programme of €45.7m.

The Appraisal, Planning and Incurring Expenditure of the Phase 2 Volumetric Rapid Build Housing (Bundle 1) is project at the *incurring* stage. The project has a budgeted capital spend of €82.3M for Phase 2 (Bundle 1).

The overall objective of the audits was to ascertain if the management of the spending was in compliance with the Public Spending Code (PSC). Formal reports on the in-depth reviews have been completed and submitted to the Chief Executive.

The overall finding for the **Dalymount Park Redevelopment Project** is that work carried out to date for the Appraisal and Planning/Design Stages of the project complies with the requirements of the Public Spending Code, for the areas examined and the rating of **Satisfactory** was given. One recommendation was made, which has been accepted by the Chief Executive as follows:

- All contracts should be sent for sealing by the Law Agent.

The overall finding for the **Delivery of Social Housing through Approved Housing Bodies, facilitated by Dublin City Council** complied with some, but not all, of the areas examined under the requirements of the Public Spending Code and the rating of **Needs Improvement** was given.

The Chief Executive has indicated that he agrees with the overall rating. He has also accepted 5 of the 10 recommendations contained in the Internal Audit report as follows:

- Housing Department should complete the outline cost analysis and consider same.
- The Housing Department should liaise with the Finance Department to develop Oracle reports that capture all Capital and Revenue costs for Housing Projects, so that Housing Project costs are readily available on an ongoing basis.
- That DCC should take minutes of all meetings with AHBs in relation to projects.
- The Executive Manager to confirm to Internal Audit that AHB properties have been included on the Open House Management System (OHMS) and that there will be ongoing capture of AHB property changes on OHMS.
- Comprehensive DCC CAS and CALF procedures should be put in place and documented.

These recommendations are being implemented. In relation to 2 of the remaining recommendations he accepts the recommendations but has advised that there are significant resource constraints, which will delay full implementation. These recommendations are as follows:

- In respect of CALF properties, Housing Management to obtain the Annual report on the condition of properties.
- Housing Management to devise a policy on inspection regime for relevant AHB properties.

In relation to the balance of the recommendations he has advised that while he is sympathetic to what the recommendations are intended to achieve there are political sensitivities in relation to the recommendations and he does not propose to implement them at this stage. These recommendations are as follows:

- When considering options for social housing delivery using LA property, there should be documentation of the rationale for going the AHB route versus the main alternatives for social housing provision in any given situation.
- Market value of sites should be available and considered for comprehensive costing of projects.
- DCC should always seek recovery of the market value of DCC sites provided to AHBs for social housing.

The overall finding for ***The Appraisal, Planning and Incurring Expenditure of the Phase 2 Volumetric Rapid Build Housing (Bundle 1)*** was that the Appraisal, Planning and Implementation Stages of the Volumetric Phase 2(Bundle 1) addressed some but not all of the requirements of the PSC for the areas examined. The rating of **Needs Improvement** was given. The Chief Executive has indicated that he agrees with the overall rating. He has also accepted 3 of the 4 recommendations contained in the Internal Audit report as follows

- A Steering Committee and/or formal Project Board should be put in place for large Housing Projects.

- A formal project reporting process should be put in place for recording detail on individual Housing Projects
- Regulatory approvals should be obtained from the Sanctioning Authority for all projects.

The other recommendation is as follows:

- In the interest of enhanced Governance and Project oversight, the H&CS Department projects should be brought under the DCC Corporate Project Governance Board and Capital Project Support Office.

The Chief Executive has indicated that he does not accept this recommendation. His position is that housing capital projects are subject to very considerable oversight including a staged approval process by the Department of Housing, Local Government & Heritage. If housing capital projects are brought under the DCC Corporate Project Governance Board and Capital Project Support Office it will require additional resources, involve a degree of unnecessary replication and delay the delivery of high priority social housing projects.

4.0 Addressing Quality Assurance Issues

Formal Capital Project Governance procedures were implemented in Dublin City Council in 2017. A capital project governance structure is now in place where a Corporate Project Governance Board supported by a Corporate Project Support Office provide oversight of capital projects across the organisation. Improved capital project approval and monitoring processes are in place.

The Corporate Project Support Office provides support and guidance for capital projects and encourages compliance with the PSC.

The recommendations of the In-depth Checks have been incorporated into the Project Governance Guidelines within the City Council.

A training programme is delivered to Project Managers on an ongoing basis. “Project Manager Network” events take place two to three times a year which focus on compliance with the PSC, Capital Project Governance and sharing “lessons learned”.

5.0 Conclusion

The City Council has completed the necessary steps in the QA process and has prepared the required Inventory showing all relevant expenditure. There are 10 new procurements in excess of €10m requiring publishing for 2019, bringing it to a total of 14.

The PSC QA Report for 2018 has been published on the website.

The PSC QA Report for 2019 will also be published on the website in due course. The checklists and in-depth checks have demonstrated a satisfactory level of compliance with the Public Spending Code, with some issues or concerns being highlighted through the process. Areas for improvement identified in this report will be incorporated into the project governance within the organisation and progress monitored so as to ensure high compliance with the PSC within the City Council.

Appendix 1 Project/Programme Inventory:

Local Authority	Expenditure being considered				Expenditure being incurred			Expenditure recently ended			Notes
	Current > €0.5m	Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m	Capital		Current Expenditure	> €0.5m Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	Current Expenditure	> €0.5m Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	
			€0.5 - €5m	€5 - €20m							
Dublin City Council											
Housing & Building											
Aulla Park Community Centre			€1,250,000.00								
Purchase of Fire Appliances							€7,871,163.00				
Bathath Avenue - Nouses (CAG)			€1,400,000.00								
St. Oliver's Day House Upgrade			€2,240,000.00								
Ballyfermot Village Environmental Improvement Scheme										€1,000,000.00	Not Proceeding. The Ballyfermot Village was suspended by the draft proposals from the NTA regarding BusConnects which included major works on the main road.
Refurbishment of Nui Grove Fire Station			€1,040,000.00								
Grove Lane			€1,250,000.00								
Matt Talbot Street Housing Development			€1,500,000.00								
Dunnes Street Housing Development							€1,500,000.00				
Bolton Street - Nouses (CAG)										€1,250,000.00	no longer an AIB project
New Street Peter McVerry Trust (CAG)			€1,700,000.00								
Cappagh Road & Wellmount Avenue			€2,000,000.00								
Cara Park Community Centre - 8 house build			€1,200,000.00								
St Margarets Park Day House Upgrade				€8,620,910.00							
Milobaham Cross - Nouses (CAG)			€2,805,852.00								
CAG Shaw Street Peter McVerry Trust			€3,000,000.00								
Newmarket Square Environmental Improvement Scheme			€4,370,000.00								
St Michael's Estate Regeneration also known as Site 1 & 2				€17,219,334.00							
Michael's Estate Inclusion											
Call for Proposals Acquisitions 2018-20 (CAG)							€30,000,000.00				
CAG 25-26 Ushers Island Dublin Simon							€13,500,000.00				
Dolphin House Phase 2							€41,000,000.00				
PHASE 2 VOLUMETRIC (Bundles 1 to 3-587 units)							€175,000,000.00				provisional allowance in the 2018-20 Budget to indicate the future Rapid developments which were at an early stage without any specific sites being listed. As sites are identified and as costs begin to accrue new centres are opened for each individual development
Feasibility of Land for Development - Travellers							€500,000.00				
Naas Road - 3 house site							€967,005.00				Project on hold due to objections regarding connection to main sewers. Alternative to sewer connections currently being investigated.
Tara Lanes							€1,600,000.00				
Bain Street Flats Refurbishment										€750,000.00	
Cambridge Road							€900,000.00				
St Joseph's Day House Upgrade							€2,240,000.00				
Special Needs Adapted Traveller Accommodation							€1,100,000.00				
Peter McVerry Trust - St Agatha										€1,170,000.00	Project complete but awaiting final account
Franklin House - Acquisition NGA BATTERS LANE CRUMLIN ROAD/SOCIAL TANKA/TRANGHAW HOUSE(1,55ADELL)							€37,700,000.00				
REGENERATION							€1,275,000.00				
Woodbank Drive											
Ballyfermot Civic Investment Programme also known as Ballyfermot Community Civic Centre Upgrade							€1,300,000.00				
77a St. Stephen's Green										€1,500,000.00	
Tuath - Gallery Quay							€1,750,000.00				
Broom Lodge Child										€1,785,899.00	
Abberly Court Hotel										€4,200,000.00	
St Brigid's Park							€2,000,000.00				
Martens House										€2,300,000.00	
7 Ellis Quay - emergency accommodation										€2,156,638.00	
Energy Efficiency Upgrade Project Ballyman										€2,290,000.00	Ongoing - rolling project no fixed asset
CAG CALLS TOWNSEND STREET 2017							€2,610,000.00				
The Royal Hospital Donsybrook Vivic Nos 15-30 Beech Hill Terrace										€3,050,000.00	
Library Square Ringsend							€2,900,000.00				
Alding House, St. Lawrence's Road, Clontarf										€2,978,800.00	
St Dominics Redevelopment							€2,000,000.00				
Belcamp Site B							€3,200,000.00				
Construction Greendale Community Centre							€3,227,177.00				
Little Britain Street - emergency accommodation										€4,250,000.00	

Appendix 1 Project/Programme Inventory:

Local Authority	Expenditure being considered				Expenditure being incurred			Expenditure recently ended			Notes
	Current > €0.5m	Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m	Capital		Current Expenditure	> €0.5m Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	Current Expenditure	> €0.5m Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	
			€0.5 - €5m	€5 - €20m							
Dublin City Council											
Balfour Lane - Walk											€1,100,000.00
Bathilly Park / Virginia Park										€3,520,000.00	
Francis Street Environmental Improvement Scheme										€3,605,000.00	
CV Ballybough Road 2-6										€4,125,000.00	
Ayrefield / Sladmore										€3,750,000.00	
Elle Court - Tuath											€6,700,000.00
Moss Street 33-34 Cooperative Housing Ireland											€1,500,000.00 No longer an AHS project.
Mardiffstown Emergency Accommodation											€6,500,000.00 Operational now managed by Peter McVerry Trust
Elmore Road											€8,200,000.00
Redevelopment Labra Park											€12,500,000.00
Boiler Replacement Programme											€9,000,000.00 Rolling Programme not fixed asset - non project
Mallowes Road Emergency Accommodation											€9,850,000.00
CAS (Housing Agency Acquisitions) for Peter McVerry Trust											€30,000,000.00
North King Street											€11,500,000.00
Redevelopment of Booterstown Park											€11,750,000.00
NDIC Arts Centre James Joyce Street/ Foley Street											€11,831,770.00
Bunnally Road (Jolumetric)											€34,000,000.00
Infirmery Road / Montpellier Hill											€17,800,000.00
Constitution Hill Refurb Scheme											€34,500,000.00
Rutland Street School											€18,046,980.00
Elmsdale - Cherry Orchard											€15,000,000.00
CAS - Calls for Proposals 2016- Acquisitions											€15,000,000.00
CAS CALLS FOR ACQUISITIONS 2017											€20,000,000.00
Dorset Street Refurb Scheme AKA DORSET STREET DEMOLITION & NEW BUILD											€57,900,000.00 Project "St Mary's Pilot" listed on 2017 inventory is now part of this project
Energy Efficiency Works AKA ENERGY EFFECENCY WORKS PHASE 2											€17,400,000.00 Rolling Programme not fixed asset - non project
Cork Street/Chamber Street Housing Development											€19,443,555.00
Bonham Street Housing Development											€19,443,555.00
Springvale Chapel Road Housing Development											€19,443,555.00
Comanona (Comanona Court Redevelopment)											€20,651,000.00
O'Donovan Gardens Phase 1(A)											€20,700,000.00
CV - Croke Villas Redevelopment											€27,200,000.00 Delayed pending outcome of judicial review
Dolphin House Phase 1											€26,500,000.00
Cromcastle Housing Development											€27,500,000.00
St Teresas Gardens Redevelopment (Procurement of)											€34,000,000.00
Lower Dominic Street also known as Dominic St. East Side Regeneration											€42,254,000.00
Flory Hall Security and Miscellaneous Charge AKA FLORY HALL REMEDIATION											€38,000,000.00
O'Donovan Gardens HU											€125,500,000.00
Oscar Traynor HU											€147,000,000.00
St. Michael's Estate Regeneration HU											€190,000,000.00
Grove Lane Phase 2											€1,750,000.00 Project stalled
St. Flabers Court											€17,000,000.00
Cromcastle - Regeneration											€1,500,000.00
National Homeless IT Centre											€1,043,040.00
Kilmore Road (Family Hub)											€5,000,000.00
Refurbishment of 5 Homeless Shelters (Dublin Simon)											€1,800,000.00
Arbour Hill (Dublin Simon) (CAS)											€4,931,000.00
Dolphine Barr Environmental Improvement Scheme											€1,850,000.00
Cork Street Environmental Improvement Scheme											€3,000,000.00
Meath Street Public Realm Improvement											€3,000,000.00
Scrabblestown Improvement Works											€500,000.00
Barrow Road Housing Development											€5,500,000.00
146-156 Harold's Cross Road Dublin RW											€1,074,000.00
Dolphin House Phase 2B Construction of 34 Units											€15,500,000.00
Glin Court Housing Development											€9,871,490.00
Proposed Fire Brigade Depot at Belgard Road											€7,300,000.00

Appendix 1 Project/Programme Inventory:

Local Authority	Expenditure being considered				Expenditure being incurred			Expenditure recently ended			Notes
	Current	Capital		Capital Projects	Current Expenditure	Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	Current Expenditure	Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	
	> €10.5m	€10.5m - €15m	€15m - €20m								
€10.5m	€15m - €20m	€20m - €25m	€25m plus								
Dublin City Council											
A01 Maintenance / Improvement of LA Housing Units					72,543,000						
A02 Housing Assessment, Allocations and Transfers					7,385,000						
A03 Housing Rent and Tenant Purchase Admin					9,558,000						
A04 Housing Community Development Support					23,075,000						
A05 Administration of Homeless Service					175,569,000						
A06 Support to Housing Capital Programme					29,410,000						
A07 RAS Programme					45,754,000						
A08 Housing Loans					30,841,000						
A09 Housing Grant					12,418,000						
A12 HAP Programme					14,938,000						
Road Transportation and Safety											
BDV Software Upgrade		€500,000.00									
Mary Street Improvements		€97,875.00									
Flanover Street East		€1,000,000.00									
Overhead Network Upgrade (New)		€900,000.00									project temporarily on hold
Cardforbes Street		€1,875,000.00									
Jiffey Boardwalk Upgrade		€2,378,500.00									
Tom Clarke Bridge Upgrade			€5,000,000.00								project on hold
South Campshire Cycleway										€500,000.00	
Fibre Optic Garda HQ Unit						€754,653.00					
Traffic Management Weather System for DCC						€500,000.00					listed on 2017 inventory as incurring expenditure. Project is currently being considered. It is on hold
Docklands Pedestrian & Cyclist Bridge - North Wall Quay						€671,717.00					
Hole in the Wall Roundabout Junction Improvements										€700,000.00	
Clerendon Row						€650,041.00					
NW Bus Priority Project						€1,485,120.00					
City Centre High Density Cycle Parking						€1,904,811.00					project on hold
Be Good Project						€906,121.00					
Cattle Street						€1,000,000.00					suspended pending a review
Bus Lanes North & South Quays										€1,000,000.00	
Webb City										€1,554,520.00	
Junction of Balbutcher Lane & Poppintree Lane West (Balbutcher Lane Junction Reconfiguration)						€1,534,760.00					
Elizabeth Street Cycle Route						€1,800,000.00					
Cycle Parking AKA On Street Cycle Parking						€1,949,307.00					
Blackhorse Avenue Sect 2 Road Improvement Scheme										€2,180,000.00	
Loss Associated Works						€2,000,000.00					
Fibre Optic Network Project						€3,665,574.00					
Stratton Street Works Harry Street / Balle Street (Dunham Street/Harry Street)										€2,777,606.00	
Clerendon Street						€2,585,000.00					
Balmagne Street & Balmayne Avenue Scheme						€6,094,513.00					
Jiffey Street Improvements						€3,172,345.00					
River Dodder Greenway Herbert Park to Donnybrook						€3,331,267.00					
Point Junction Improvement Scheme						€3,467,000.00					
Duke Street, South Anne Street						€4,000,000.00					
LED Improvement Scheme						€2,882,335.00					
The Broadstone Plaza						€4,100,000.00					
Transport Asset Management System (TAMS)										€4,283,973.00	
RD14/2014 Royal Canal Greenway Phase 4 Phibsborough to Ashdown						€4,716,377.00					
Ballyman Siligoe Infrastructure						€4,998,800.00					
Junction Changes due to City Centre Proposals										€5,000,000.00	The scope of the project changed and was drastically reduced from two junction redesigns to one pedestrian crossing which has been completed
Revision to Chapel Road Greenway Cycle Route						€5,500,000.00					Project was listed as incurring expenditure on 2017 inventory. Project is on hold
DS Cycle/Walkway Scheme Bull Island to Cauterway Road										€6,600,000.00	At post project review but still drainage issue at 2 locations to be resolved
Royal Canal North Strand to Phibsborough Road						€,482,000					
Royal Canal Premium Cycle Route Phase 2 Sheriff Street to North						8,987,946					

Appendix 1 Project/Programme Inventory:

Local Authority	Expenditure being considered				Expenditure being incurred			Expenditure recently ended			Notes
	Current > €0.5m	Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m	Capital		Current Expenditure	> €0.5m Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	Current Expenditure	> €0.5m Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	
			€0.5 - €2m	€2m - €20m							
Dublin City Council											
College Green Plaza										€10,000,000.00	
Clontarf to City Centre Cycle Scheme Fairview to Arlene Street										€12,834,467.00	
East Link Upgrade (now changed to Point Pedestrian and Cycle Bridge)										€13,000,000.00	
Real Time Passenger Information System										€13,207,070.00	
Forbes Street Pedestrian Bridge and Cycle Bridge (now named Bloodstone Bridge due to change in location)										€17,000,000.00	
Sandford (Clonsillaigh) to City Centre Cycle Route										€17,579,400.00	
Grand Canal Blackhorse to Portobello										€17,927,240.00	Project was listed as incurring expenditure on 2017 Inventory. Project is on hold.
Dodder Cyclist and Pedestrian Improvements										€23,496,855.00	Project on Hold
Dodder Bridge										€31,500,000.00	
Liffey Cycle Route										€33,641,171.00	
Lighting Infrastructure Upgrade Project										€55,390,000.00	
St. Margaret's Link Road			€2,140,000.00								
Severe Weather Road Repairs Programme AIA Storm Emma Damage Repairs											€6,300,000.00
East Coast Trail (Arlia Byrne Rd-EastWall Road)			€4,675,000.00								Project on Hold
East Coast Trail (Sean Moore Rd-Merrion Gate)				€5,100,000.00							
Phillys Area Roundabouts			€850,000.00								
South Grand Canal Cycle Lanes Improvement Scheme			€2,000,000.00								
CHOLE SAFE INTERSECTIONS			€3,000,000.00								Project on Hold
Tom Clarke Bridge - Toll System Upgrade			€2,500,000.00								
Callack Stream Culvert Replacement											€3,400,000.00
Purchase of Compact Sweepers											€ 2,091,000.00
Bike Bunkers			€1,540,000.00								
803 Regional Road - Improvement & Mize							35,107,000				
804 Local Road - Improvement & Mize							40,633,000				
805 Public Lighting							30,455,000				
806 Traffic Management Improvement							30,503,000				
808 Road Safety Promotion/Education							4,004,000				
809 Car Parking							13,811,000				
810 Support to Roads Capital Programme							3,833,000				
811 Agency & Recoupable Services							1,578,000				
Water Services											
Grand Canal Basin Amenity & Water Quality Project			€750,000.00								
South Campbells S22 Project Sir John Rogersons Quay											This project is being incorporated in to Docklands Public Realm - South Campbells under Development Management
Surface Water Network Improvement Works			€3,000,000.00								
Sandymount Flood Defences Phase 1 and 2										€600,000.00	
Dublin Flood Forecasting & Flood Warning System										€1,235,386.00	
Flood Alleviation Fleet										€2,000,000.00	
Culvert Improvement Works - Screen Upgrade Works										€2,183,255.00	
Implementing Flood Resilient City Outcome										€2,443,806.00	
Campbells Flood Protection Project										€2,500,000.00	
Puddle Flood Alleviation										€3,100,000.00	
North Campbells Flood Defence Future Climate Change											This project is being incorporated in to Docklands Public Realm - North Campbells under Development Management
Water Framework Directive Office										€5,046,056.00	
Flooding Emergency Works & Flood Defence Repairs										€3,440,000.00	
River Wad Study and Construction Works AIA RIVER WAD - CLANNMOLLE ROAD FLOOD ALLEVIATION SCHEME										€4,000,000.00	
Clontarf Flood Relief AKA CLONTARF FLOOD DEFENCE PROJECT										€3,888,000.00	
S25 Phase 2 Surface Water AIA S25 PHASE 2 (LIFFEY TO SANDYMOUNT/SOUTH CITY FLOOD DEFENCES)										€5,087,000.00	
S25 Phase 1 Sutton to Liffey AKA S25 PHASE 1 (KILBARRACK TO LIFFEY, DOLLYMOUNT AND BULL ISLAND)										€7,000,000.00	
Dodder Flood Works AIA (LOWER RIVER DODDER FLOOD ALLEVIATION SCHEME PHASE 2 AND 3)										€5,200,000.00	
026 Water Supply							28,152,000				
027 Waste Water Treatment							11,149,000				
027 Agency & Recoupable Services							3,546,000				
028 Local Authority Water and Sanitary Services							13,030,000				

Appendix 1 Project/Programme Inventory:

Local Authority	Expenditure being considered				Expenditure being incurred			Expenditure recently ended			Notes
	Current > €0.5m	Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m	Capital		Current Expenditure	> €0.5m Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	Current Expenditure	> €0.5m Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	
			€0.5 - €5m	€5 - €20m							
Dublin City Council											
Development Management											
Ballymun Civic Centre Remedial / Maintenance							€650,000.00				
Ballymun Civic Centre Reconfiguration Works										€650,000.00	
Wayfinding Scheme New Phase 2016							€760,000.00				
Demolition of Ballymun Shopping Centre							€1,900,000.00				
Irish Market (20-27 Francis Street)							€16,500,000.00				Surveys being carried out to ascertain the level of stabilisation works required for the building, still legal proceedings around the transfer of title back to DCC
Market Refurbishment Project Phase 2							€6,134,456.00				
Docklands Fibre Ducting							€6,415,783.00				
Ballymun Shopping Centre										€10,650,000.00	
Docklands Office Remedial Works / George's Dock Facility							€12,472,067.00				
Docklands Public Realm							€14,000,360.00				
Active Land Management Fund							€20,661,617.00				
Dublinbikes Phase 3 Expansion							€1,440,000.00				Recently Ended 2018 but then additional stations added in 2019
Affordable Housing Serviced Sites Fund				€16,000,000.00							
D01 Forward Planning					5,831,000						
D02 Development Management					8,593,000						
D03 Enforcement					2,454,000						
D04 Industrial & Commercial Facilities					11,182,000						
D06 Community & Enterprise Function					8,514,000						
D08 Building Control					3,544,000						
D09 Economic Development & Promotion					6,141,000						
D11 Heritage and Conservation Services					2,935,000						
Environmental Services											
District Heating Project Phase 2							€920,504.00				Noted as incurring expenditure on 2017 Inventory. It is currently being considered
Purchase of Fleet							€1,202,000.00				
Waste to Energy Project Construction & Commissioning Phase										€4,397,885.00	
E01 Landfill Operation and Aftercare					1,436,000						
E02 Recovery & Recycling Facilities Operations					4,081,000						
E04 Provision of Waste Collection Services					1,782,000						
E05 Litter Management					4,521,000						
E06 Street Cleaning					40,935,000						
E07 Waste Reg., Monitoring & Enforcement					5,828,000						
E08 Waste Management Planning					1,377,000						
E10 Safety of Structures & Places					3,857,000						
E11 Operation of Fire Service					129,029,000						
E12 Fire Prevention					3,252,000						
E13 Water Quality, Air & Noise Pollution					968,000						
E14 Agency & Recoupable Services					1,294,000						
E15 Climate Change & Flooding					843,000						
Recreation and Amenity											
Ballyfermot Leisure Centre - Gym Extension			€654,200.00								
Ringier Library			€2,083,932.00								
Clongriffin Library aka North Fringe Library			€2,500,000.00								
Crumilly/Drimnagh (new development)							€1,500,000.00				
Terenure Library Redevelopment			€3,828,213.00								
Ballyfermot Leisure Centre - New Pitch							€517,000.00				
REIMAGING Dublin One							€1,500,000.00				Housing Department project
Rainbow Park Tearooms							€1,458,170.00				
Bull Island							€729,212.00				

Appendix 1 Project/Programme Inventory:

Local Authority	Expenditure being considered				Expenditure being incurred			Expenditure recently ended			Notes
	Current > 40.5m	Capital Grant Schemes > 40.5m	Capital		Current Expenditure	> 40.5m Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	Current Expenditure	> 40.5m Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	
			40.5 - 45m	45 - 420m							
Dublin City Council											
Chocolate Park Docklands (Renamed Benson Street Park)						€394,052.00					
St. James's Graveyard						€1,220,656.00					Housing Department project
Grafton St and Environs									€1,000,000.00		Housing Department project
Merrion Square Conservation Plan									€1,346,672.00		
Mountjoy Square Conservation Plan						€1,300,000.00					
Bushy Park Tea Rooms						€1,454,170.00					
Parrell Square Cultural Quarter						€1,777,557.00					
Bridgefoot Street Park						€1,843,750.00					
Refurbishment of Wolfe Tone Park						€1,872,712.00					
Le Fanu Park Playground						€1,880,450.00					
Temple Bar Square						€2,346,355.00					
Coolock Library						€2,475,035.00					
Merrion Square Tearooms						€2,600,000.00					
Hugh Lane Gallery						€3,402,743.00					
Kevin Street Library Refurbishment									€ 3,739,446.00		
Liffey Vale, Liffey Valley Park						€4,994,182.00					
UNESCO - Dublin Bay Discovery Centre						€13,961,255.00					
Development of Dalmount Park						€35,638,408.00					
Inchicore Library Refurbishment						€1,273,344.00					
CEARNÓG - BALLYMUN						€1,500,000.00					
DIAMOND PARK UPGRADE						€700,000.00					
CHRISTCHURCH GROUNDS PHASE 2						€750,000.00					
EAMONN CEANNT DEPOT						€965,000.00					
ROCKFIELD PARK PADEL/TENNIS PAVILION						€1,300,000.00					
EAMONN CEANNT PARK PADEL/TENNIS PAVILION						€850,000.00					
RINGLAS/TOLKA VALLEY PARK ALL-WEATHER GAA PITCH						€1,300,000.00					
BELCAMP ALL WEATHER PITCH						€589,000.00					
St. Audreons Park Refurbishment			€1,566,136.00								
St. Anne's Tennis & Bowling Green						€1,866,900.00					
R01 Leisure Facilities Operations					10,854,000						
R02 Operation of Library & Archive Service					25,920,000						
R03 Outdoor Leisure Areas Operations					25,467,000						
R04 Community, Sport & Recreational Dev					20,536,000						
R05 Operation of Arts Programme					17,613,000						
Agriculture, Education, Health and Welfare											
G04 Veterinary Service					705,000						
G05 Education Support Services					1,076,000						
Miscellaneous Services											
Records Centre									€1,000,000.00		This project will now not go ahead.
GDPR Security						€2,000,000.00					
Smart Cities Project						€1,620,477.00					
IS Infrastructure Project						€7,860,250.00					
Core Implementation						€6,305,000.00					
Design & Construction of a North City Operations Depot Ballymun						€54,077,462.00					
Accessibility Works & Landscaping Works to Mansion House & Gardens			€508,658.00								
H03 Administration of Rates					24,031,000						
H04 Franchise Costs					1,348,000						
H07 Operation of Markets & Casual Trading					1,126,000						
H09 Local Representation/Civic Leadership					6,015,000						
H10 Motor Traction					5,652,000						
H11 Agency & Recoupable Services					9,108,000						

Appendix 2: Completed Checklists

Dublin City Council

Checklist 1 – To be completed in respect of general obligations not specific to individual projects/programmes

General Obligations not specific to individual projects/ programmes	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 – 3	Discussion/Action Required
1.1 Does the local authority ensure, on an on-going basis, that appropriate people within the authority and its agencies are aware of the requirements of the Public Spending Code (incl. through training)?	3	
1.2 Has training on the Public Spending Code been provided to relevant staff within the authority?	3	
1.3 Has the Public Spending Code been adapted for the type of project/programme that your local authority is responsible for? i.e., have adapted sectoral guidelines been developed?	3	Governance Guidelines have been produced and are available to all staff on DCC intranet
1.4 Has the local authority in its role as Sanctioning Authority satisfied itself that agencies that it funds comply with the Public Spending Code?	3	
1.5 Have recommendations from previous QA reports (incl. spot checks) been disseminated, where appropriate, within the local authority and to agencies?	3	
1.6 Have recommendations from previous QA reports been acted upon?	2	
1.7 Has an annual Public Spending Code QA report been certified by the local authority's Chief Executive, submitted to NOAC and published on the authority's website?	3	
1.8 Was the required sample of projects/programmes subjected to in-depth checking as per step 4 of the QAP?	3	
1.9 Is there a process in place to plan for ex post evaluations/Post Project Reviews? Ex-post evaluation is conducted after a certain period has passed since the completion of a target project with	2	New DCC Governance procedures have been in place since 2017. A key part of these procedures is the carrying out of post project reviews at the completion of projects.

emphasis on the effectiveness and sustainability of the project.		
1.10 How many formal Post Project Review evaluations have been completed in the year under review? Have they been issued promptly to the relevant stakeholders / published in a timely manner?	N/A	3 post project reviews were carried out for projects in 2019 in line with the DCC Governance procedures. These projects were less than €20 million in value and do not meet the criteria requiring publishing of project reviews.
1.11 Is there a process to follow up on the recommendations of previous evaluations/Post project reviews?	2	A DCC Project Manager Network is in place since 2018. This facilitates communication between the Corporate Project Governance Board, the Corporate Project Support Office and Project Managers corporately. One of the key functions of the network is the communication of lessons learned and identification of areas of improvement.
1.12 How have the recommendations of previous evaluations / post project reviews informed resource allocation decisions?	N/A	

Checklist 2 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes that were under consideration in the past year

Capital Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
2.1 Was a preliminary appraisal undertaken for all projects > €5m?	3	
2.2 Was an appropriate appraisal method used in respect of capital projects or capital programmes/grant schemes?	3	
2.3 Was a CBA/CEA completed for all projects exceeding €20m?	3	
2.4 Was the appraisal process commenced at an early stage to facilitate decision making? (i.e. prior to the decision)	3	
2.5 Was an Approval in Principle granted by the Sanctioning Authority for all projects before they entered the planning and design phase (e.g. procurement)?	3	
2.6 If a CBA/CEA was required was it submitted to the relevant Department for their views?	3	
2.7 Were the NDFA consulted for projects costing more than €20m?	2	Adhering to DHPLG guidance on CEAs for housing projects
2.8 Were all projects that went forward for tender in line with the Approval in Principle and, if not, was the detailed appraisal revisited and a fresh Approval in Principle granted?	3	
2.9 Was approval granted to proceed to tender?	3	
2.10 Were procurement rules complied with?	3	
2.11 Were State Aid rules checked for all supports?	3	

2.12 Were the tenders received in line with the Approval in Principle in terms of cost and what is expected to be delivered?	3	
2.13 Were performance indicators specified for each project/programme that will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date?	2	Further work is being advised in this area
2.14 Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data?	2	Ongoing through the CPSO

Checklist 3 – To be completed in respect of new current expenditure under consideration in the past year.

Current Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
3.1 Were objectives clearly set out?	3	
3.2 Are objectives measurable in quantitative terms?	3	
3.3 Was a business case, incorporating financial and economic appraisal, prepared for new current expenditure?	3	
3.4 Was an appropriate appraisal method used?	3	
3.5 Was an economic appraisal completed for all projects exceeding €20m or an annual spend of €5m over 4 years?	3	
3.6 Did the business case include a section on piloting?	N/A	
3.7 Were pilots undertaken for new current spending proposals involving total expenditure of at least €20m over the proposed duration of the programme and a minimum annual expenditure of €5m?	N/A	
3.8 Have the methodology and data collection requirements for the pilot been agreed at the outset of the scheme?	2	
3.9 Was the pilot formally evaluated and submitted for approval to the relevant Department?	N/A	
3.10 Has an assessment of likely demand for the new scheme/scheme extension been estimated based on empirical evidence?	2	
3.11 Was the required approval granted?	3	

3.12 Has a sunset clause (as defined in section B06, 4.2 of the Public Spending Code) been set?	2	
3.13 If outsourcing was involved were procurement rules complied with?	3	
3.14 Were performance indicators specified for each new current expenditure proposal or expansion of existing current expenditure programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date?	3	
3.15 Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data?	3	

Checklist 4 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grants schemes incurring expenditure in the year under review

Incurring Capital Expenditure	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
4.1 Was a contract signed and was it in line with the Approval in Principle?	3	
4.2 Did management boards/steering committees meet regularly as agreed?	3	
4.3 Were programme co-ordinators appointed to co-ordinate implementation?	3	
4.4 Were project managers, responsible for delivery, appointed and were the project managers at a suitably senior level for the scale of the project?	3	
4.5 Were monitoring reports prepared regularly, showing implementation against plan, budget, timescales and quality?	3	
4.6 Did projects/programmes/grant schemes keep within their financial budget and time schedule?	2	Further work required by implementing Project Managers with the support of Corporate Project Support Office
4.7 Did budgets have to be adjusted?	2	Further work required by implementing Project Managers with the support of Corporate Project Support Office
4.8 Were decisions on changes to budgets / time schedules made promptly?	3	
4.9 Did circumstances ever warrant questioning the viability of the project/programme/grant scheme and the business case incl. CBA/CEA? (exceeding budget, lack of progress, changes in the environment, new evidence, etc.)	3	
4.10 If circumstances did warrant questioning the viability of a project/programme/grant scheme, was the project subjected to adequate examination?	3	

4.11 If costs increased was approval received from the Sanctioning Authority?	3	
4.12 Were any projects/programmes/grant schemes terminated because of deviations from the plan, the budget or because circumstances in the environment changed the need for the investment?	3	

Checklist 5 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes incurring expenditure in the year under review

Incurring Current Expenditure	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 -3	Comment/Action Required
5.1 Are there clear objectives for all areas of current expenditure?	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Annual Statutory Budget process • Corporate plan • Service plans • PMDS / Team Development Plans • Risk Management • SLA Agreements/Annual service plans which include KPI's
5.2 Are outputs well defined?	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National KPI's • Dublin City Council KPI's • Team Development plans(TDP) & Personal Development plans (PDP) targets • SLA Targets
5.3 Are outputs quantified on a regular basis?	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quarterly budget monitoring and reporting • Quarterly reporting to DHPLG on Payroll, Borrowings, Capital & Revenue Income and Expenditure, Debtors and GGB • Strategic Policy and Area Committees reporting • Half yearly review of TDP and PDP/Monthly Monitoring • Annual Report • KPI's • Department Statistical Returns • Regional Steering Group • LGMA
5.4 Is there a method for monitoring efficiency on an on-going basis?	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Procurement monitoring • Shared services review • Internal and External auditors • Quarterly budget reporting • Planned services / function reviews • Monthly meetings

5.5 Are outcomes well defined?	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Targets are defined in the Annual Budget, Corporate Plan, Service Plans and Team plans • Annual plans
5.6 Are outcomes quantified on a regular basis?	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Annual Report • Annual Budgets • Quarterly Budget Monitoring • SPC reporting • Audit Committee
5.7 Are unit costings compiled for performance monitoring?	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Budget Monitoring • KPI's • Unit Costing where appropriate
5.8 Are other data compiled to monitor performance?	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TDP/PDP • VFM • All relevant matrix and reviewed
5.9 Is there a method for monitoring effectiveness on an on-going basis?	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Combination of all above • Formal reviews of some of DCC Departments / functions • Reports and Team Meetings
5.10 Has the organisation engaged in any other 'evaluation proofing' ¹ of programmes/projects?	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • External review is part of sectoral efficiency programme • European evaluation

¹ Evaluation proofing involves checking to see if the required data is being collected so that when the time comes a programme/project can be subjected to a robust evaluation. If the data is not being collected, then a plan should be put in place to collect the appropriate indicators to allow for the completion of a robust evaluation down the line.

Checklist 6 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes discontinued and/or evaluated during the year under review

Capital Expenditure Recently Completed	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
6.1 How many post project reviews were completed in the year under review?	2	3 post project reviews were carried out for projects in 2019 in line with the DCC Governance procedures.
6.2 Was a post project review completed for all projects/programmes exceeding €20m?	3	Yes
6.3 Was a post project review completed for all capital grant schemes where the scheme both (1) had an annual value in excess of €30m and (2) where scheme duration was five years or more?	n/a	
6.4 Aside from projects over €20m and grant schemes over €30m, was the requirement to review 5% (Value) of all other projects adhered to?	3	
6.5 If sufficient time has not elapsed to allow for a proper assessment, has a post project review been scheduled for a future date?	2	Improvement work is currently being carried out on this by the Corporate Project Support Office
6.6 Were lessons learned from post-project reviews disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency and to the Sanctioning Authority? (Or other relevant bodies)	2	Improvement work is currently being carried out on this by the Corporate Project Support Office
6.7 Were changes made to practices in light of lessons learned from post-project reviews?	2	Improvement work is currently being carried out on this by the Corporate Project Support Office

6.8 Were project reviews carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	2	Improvement work is currently being carried out on this by the Corporate Project Support Office
---	---	---

Checklist 7 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes that reached the end of their planned timeframe during the year or were discontinued

Current Expenditure that (i) reached the end of its planned timeframe or (ii) was discontinued	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
7.1 Were reviews carried out of current expenditure programmes that matured during the year or were discontinued?	N/A	
7.2 Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were efficient?	N/A	
7.3 Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were effective?	N/A	
7.4 Have the conclusions reached been taken into account in related areas of expenditure?	N/A	
7.5 Were any programmes discontinued following a review of a current expenditure programme?	N/A	
7.6 Were reviews carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	N/A	
7.7 Were changes made to the organisation's practices in light of lessons learned from reviews?	N/A	

Notes:

- ❖ The scoring mechanism for the above checklists is as follows:
 - Scope for significant improvements = a score of 1
 - Compliant but with some improvement necessary = a score of 2
 - Broadly compliant = a score of 3

- ❖ For some questions, the scoring mechanism is not always strictly relevant. In these cases, it is appropriate to mark as N/A and provide the required information in the commentary box as appropriate.

- ❖ The focus should be on providing descriptive and contextual information to frame the compliance ratings and to address the issues raised for each question. It is also important

to provide summary details of key analytical outputs covered in the sample for those questions which address compliance with appraisal/evaluation requirements i.e. the annual number of appraisals (e.g. Cost Benefit Analyses or Multi Criteria Analyses), evaluations (e.g. Post Project Reviews). Key analytical outputs undertaken but outside of the sample should also be noted in the report.