Conservation Section, Planning & Property Development Department Civic Offices, Wood Quay, Dublin 8

An Rannóg Caomhantais, An Roinn Pleanála agus Forbairt Maoine Oifigí na Cathrach, An Ché Adhmaid, Baile Átha Cliath 8 Email: conservation@dublincity.ie T. 01 222 3927

29 June 2022 (updated from previous report of 15 March 2022)

To the Chairperson and Members of the Central Area Committee

Initiation of the Statutory Process for the Proposed Addition of 20/21 Moore Street, Dublin 1, to the Record of Protected Structures in accordance with Sections 54 and 55 of the Planning and Development Act, 2000 (as amended).

The initiation of the statutory addition process was noted by the Central Area Committee of Dublin City Council at its monthly meeting held on 12<sup>th</sup> April 2022.



## **Photograph of Structure**

## **Requests and Reasons for Addition:**

• The Elected Members of Dublin City Council at the monthly council meeting held on 8<sup>th</sup> June 2015, passed a motion put forward by Councillor John Lyons (Motion 44): "That the following 1916 Buildings (Add 569), identified in the Franc Myles Battlefield Report, commissioned by

Shaffrey Associates on behalf of Chartered Land, be added to the list of protected structures as buildings of National historical importance. 1 .O' Briens Mineral Water Building, Henry Place - Occupied by volunteers. 2 .The White House, Henry Place - Occupied and held by Michael Collins. 3. No.10 Moore Street - Point of entry -The First Council of War - Overnight stay. 4. The Bottling Stores rear. 10 Moore Street and Moore Lane - Occupied by Frank Henderson. 5. Hanlons, 20/21 Moore Street - Surrender order accepted by volunteers after consultation with Thomas Clarke, Joseph Plunkett, Michael Collins and Sean Mac Diarmada".

- Donna Cooney on 9 December 2015 as part of Draft Dublin Development Plan 2016-22 (Submission 2564). 'I would recommend the listing of all the houses on Moore Street from No.10 through to the last house on the terrace to keep the character of the street scape at the site of the National Monument 14-17 Moore Street' (Add700).
- Patrick Cooney: for architectural and historical reasons (Add296): Architectural: 19<sup>th</sup> century red brick over 20<sup>th</sup> century shop-front. Possible 18<sup>th</sup> century elements. Historical: Believed to be part of the Moore Street HQ Block. It is also believed that MacDiarmada, Clarke and Collins were here with the London Irish Kimmage Garrison. The backyard is where surrender was finally accepted by the garrison members.

The structures referred to in the first bullet point above have been assessed individually with a separate report for each. 20/21 Moore Street, Dublin 1, forms the subject of this report.

# **Location and Land Use Zoning:**

20/21 Moore Street is located in an area zoned Z5, the objective of which is: "To consolidate and facilitate the development of the central area, and to identify, reinforce, strengthen and protect its civic design character and dignity".



Figure 1: Site Location and Zoning Map

#### **Architectural Conservation Area:**

The buildings at 20/21 Moore Street are not within an Architectural Conservation Area, but are proximate to the designated O'Connell Street ACA (2001); shown in diagonal green coloured cross hatch on Figure 1, above.

# **Relevant Planning History:**

Planning Ref	Description of Development	Decision
2432/95	Rear of 20-21 Moore Street,, Dublin 1. Alterations, extensions and improvements to fish processing and chill store areas.	Grant Permission: 08/02/1996
1355/98	The Project includes two floors of car-parking below basement level (capacity 720 cars); four floors of mixed Retail and Leisure uses	Grant Permission: 23/10/1998

Planning Ref	Description of Development	Decision
	(approx. 40,000 sq.m. gross floor area) and comprising of Department Stores, retail units, restaurants, bars, family entertainment centre and tourist information. Also, on the upper level there are 15 multi- purpose auditoriums for cinema, conference and theatre uses. There is also a 61 bedroom hotel with associated function rooms at 46/49 Upper O'Connell Street which is presently occupied by Fingal County Council. The proposal involves building under, on and over part of Moore Lane. The listed facades of Nos. 57, 58 and Nos.52/54 Upper O'Connell Street are being retained as part of the development.	
2479/08	Description has been abbreviated	Grant Permission
	7 year permission for development at an overall site of c 2.17 hectares, at nos 40-41, 42 (a protected structure), 43 (a protected structure), 44 (a protected structure), 45-51, 52-54 (protected structures), 55-56, 57 (a protected structure), 58 (a protected structure), 59, 60 (a protected structure) and 61 (a protected structure) and 60a (otherwise 5 Henry Place) O'Connell Street Upper, Nos 37-41a Henry Street, nos 1-13, 14-17 (protected structures and a national monument) and 18-25 Moore Street, nos 71 and 71a Parnell Street, nos 1-8 O'Rahilly Parade, nos 1-15 Moore Lane, Nos 4-13 (including 3 Moore Lane) and 15-18 Henry Place, nos 6-8 at the junction of Henry Place and Moore Lane and including Clarkes Court off Moore Street, Moore Place off Henry Place, Murphys Court off Moore Lane, part of Moore Lane from the junction of Henry Place and Moore Lane to the junction of Moore Lane and O'Rahilly Parade and part of Henry Place from the junction of Moore Street and Henry Place to the rear of no. 61 O'Connell Street Upper (a protected structure), Dublin 1. The site consists of the majority of a city block bounded by Parnell Street, Moore Lane, O'Rahilly Parade, Moore Street, Henry Street, Henry Place and O'Connell Street Upper, but for the avoidance of doubt excludes nos 70 & 7275 Parnell St, Nos 37-39 & 62-69 O'Connell St Upper, Nos 31-36 Henry St & Nos 1-3 Henry Place, Dublin 1.  Note: permission granted for demolition of 20/21 Moore Street under Reg. Ref: 2479/08.	on appeal per PL29N.232347: 24/03/2010
2479/08X1	As above – Extension of Duration of Planning Permission granted per PL29N.232347.	Extension of Duration granted: 21/07/2016
3951/17	Change of use for part of previously approved retail unit from retail to retail and off-licence sales area.	

2862/21	Description has been abbreviated	Decision to Grant
	<u> </u>	Permission
	apply for Permission for a period of 7 years at a site, 'Dublin Central -	12/01/2022; now on
	1 ' ' '	appeal to An Bord
		Pleanála
	and Nos. 10 - 12 Moore Lane and Nos. 17 - 18 Henry Place (also	i icariala
	known as Nos. 4 - 5 Moore Lane), Dublin 1. Also, the site includes the	
	rear of Nos. 50 - 51 and Nos. 52 - 54 Upper O'Connell Street, No. 13	
	Moore Lane, No. 14 Moore Lane (otherwise known as Nos. 1 - 3	
	O'Rahilly Parade and Nos. 14 - 15 Moore Lane or Nos. 1 - 8 O'Rahilly	
	Parade and Nos. 14 - 15 Moore Lane), Dublin 1 and otherwise	
	generally bounded by No. 22 Moore Street and No. 13 Moore Lane to	
	the north, Moore Lane to the east, Moore Street to the west and Henry	
	Place to the south. Nos. 14 - 17 Moore Street (National Monument /	
	Protected Structures) is bounded north and south by the proposed	
	development. The proposed development comprises a mixed-use	
	scheme (c. 3,290 sq. m gross floor area) in	
	2no. parts located north and south of the Nos. 14 - 17 Moore Street	
Planning Ref	Description of Development	Decision
	(a National Monument / Protected Structures) ranging in height from	
	1 - 3 storeys including retained independent single storey basements	
	comprising 15no. apartment units (c. 1,454 sq. m gfa), café /	
	restaurant use (c. 864 sq. m gfa), retail use (c. 617 sq. m gfa), cultural	
	use (c. 60 sq. m gfa) and office use (c. 295 sq. m gfa). The proposed	
	development to the north of Nos. 14 - 17 Moore Street consists of: -	
	Nos. 20 - 21 Moore Street are refurbished and adapted to provide	
	1no. café / restaurant / licenced premises with takeaway / collection	
	facility (c. 80 sq. m in total) at ground floor addressing both Moore	
	Street and proposed new public plaza to the rear and 1no. 1-bed	
	apartment and 1no. 2 bed apartment located at 1st and 2nd floor level	
	- 4no. in total (cycle and bin storage at ground floor level). No terraces	
	or balconies are proposed to the residential units; Provision of a new	
	2 storey extension at the side of No. 17 Moore Street (National	
	Monument / Protected Structure) to act as an extension for ancillary	
	use to the National Monument - a cultural facility (c. 60 sq. m gfa);	
	Provision of an archway between the gable of No. 20 Moore Street	
	and the new 2 storey extension to No. 17 Moore Street (National	
	Monument / Protected Structure) to form an entrance to a new public	
	plaza off Moore Street; Provision of a 2 storey building with profiled	
	roof consisting 1no. licenced restaurant / café unit with takeaway / collection facility (c. 250 sq. m gfa) etc.	
	Note: The proposed development includes the retention of 20/21	
	Moore Street, with internal and external modifications; as per the	
	decision of the City Council to grant permission, including condition	
	17. (a-d) & (e) i & vi. The decision is on appeal to An Bord Pleanála.	

# **Recent Enforcement History:**

E0820/21: 20-21 Moore Street, D1, re: internal and external works.

# **Description:**

This description is based on an internal and external inspection by the Conservation Section on the 5<sup>th</sup> August 2021, consideration of research and documentation available, together with the architectural heritage documents submitted as part of planning application Reg. Ref: 2861/21.

## Exterior

20/21 Moore Street comprises a pair of former two-bay, three-storey terraced buildings, originally constructed in the mid to late 18<sup>th</sup> century. Currently occupied to ground floor with vacant upper floors (Figs. 3, 5 and 6).

The buildings now comprise a four-bay, three-storey over potential basement terraced commercial building. Early roof form to both structures running perpendicular to street with hipped sections to front and rear. Red brick chimneystack to south to No. 21 and rendered chimneystack to No. 20. Granite coping to parapet over rendered eaves course with raised rendered panels. Front façade was refaced in the late 19<sup>th</sup>/early20th century and is comprised of red brick laid in Flemish bond with later cementitious weather struck pointing. Square-headed window openings. Later enlarged window opening to first floor of No. 20 with blocked up/blind windows to second floor. Two over-two timber sash windows to No. 21, dating to circa 1900. Granite sills to window openings. Modern shopfront to ground floor. Cast-iron rainwater goods.

Rear elevation comprises buff brick laid in English garden wall bond. Brick parapet to No. 20. Castaluminium rainwater good to No. 21. Square-headed window openings with two-over-two timber sash windows, granite sills and cast-iron security bars.

Later industrial buildings to rear site (No. 12 Moore Lane) comprising three-storey industrial building with a corrugated pitched roof and concrete rendered walls. Single modern timber door to Moore Lane.

#### <u>Interior</u>

Molloy and Associates state that the *shell of No. 21 is early 18<sup>th</sup> century, retaining some corner chimneybreasts and party walls made of early handmade brick. No. 20 is slightly later in origin. The structure to the rear at No. 12 Moore Lane dates from the 1960's, comprises a two-storey concrete framed structure.... Access to the upper floors of Nos. 20 and 21 is provided across the roof of this structure (Molloy & Associates, Feb 2021, 9). This description was confirmed by the Conservation Section during its site inspection on the 5<sup>th</sup> of August 2021.* 

The ground floor comprises a large modern retail space. Surviving 18<sup>th</sup> century features were identified to the upper floors of number 21 including corner fireplaces and a dog leg, open string staircase with continuous handrail (Fig. 5). Some historic timber sash windows survive to both 20 and 21 Moore Street.

#### **Historical Background:**

Moore Street was laid out in the early 18<sup>th</sup> century as part of the Drogheda Estate. 'The Moores (Earls of Drogheda) and in particular - the third Earl of Drogheda developed the first major east west route in the new north city, Henry Street, which was complemented by Drogheda Street which ran on a north-south axis immediately to the east. Moore Street was laid out parallel to Drogheda Street, these two streets both ran into Great Britain Street to the north, an old route to Malahide and Howth' (O'Connell Street ACA, 2001, 9).

Nos. 20/21 Moore Street do not appear on Rocque's 1756 Map but do on his 1773 map: *An Accurate Survey of the City and Suburbs of Dublin by Mr John Rocque with Additions and Improvements by Mr. Bernard Scale'* (Fig. 8). The street is shown as developed with No. 20 and 21 in place. No. 20 displays a closet return typical of the 18<sup>th</sup> century while No. 21 has none. Stable structures are shown to the rear of No. 20 delinterated by the black hatched buildings to the rear.

The buildings at 20 and 21 Moore Street were occupied as separate retail units until the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. No 20 became a fishmongers shop run by the Hanlon family in the late 1870s and in about 1903 the family acquired the adjacent building at no 21 (Molloy & Associates 2021, 2).

Despite a history of alterations, No. 20/21 Moore Street still retains evidence of an 18<sup>th</sup> century roof form reflecting the street's 18<sup>th</sup> century origins (Fig. 7). No. 21 retains corner fireplaces to upper floors (Fig. 5) and an early staircase (Fig. 6).

Situated in the commercial heart of Dublin, Moore Street has always been a vibrant trading street and this continues today. In the late 19<sup>th</sup> century/early 20<sup>th</sup> century Moore Street was densely occupied with small shops and stalls in contrast with the grander establishments on Sackville Street and Henry Street (Shaffrey Associates, 2005, 3). Thoms Directory in 1916 lists 20/21 Moore Street as being occupied by Hanlon, M. and P. Fishmongers and ice merchants.

## 1916 Historical Association

Following the Easter Rising in 1916, the street, due to its proximity to the GPO, was occupied by retreating rebel forces and bore witness to the urban conflict of Easter 1916. Moore Street, Henry Place and Moore Lane were key thoroughfares associated with the 1916 Rising featuring significantly in witness statements and other contemporary documentation. All of the buildings in situ in the terrace at 10-25 Moore Street were occupied by the rebel forces on the night and morning of the 28<sup>th</sup> and 29<sup>th</sup> of April 1916. No. 16 Moore Street, was the last headquarters of the Provisional Government, where the decision to surrender was made.

A number of the combatants had vivid memories of spending the night in O'Hanlon's fish shop in particular (Nos. 20-21) (*ibid.* 10). These memories were recorded by the 'Bureau of Military History Witness Statements'. Statements for Nos. 20-21, O'Hanlon's Fishmongers include Eamonn (Ned) Bulfin II, Feargus de Burca III, Seán McLoughlin, Liam Tannam and Oscar Traynor (Shaffrey's 2005). See below for detailed accounts.

- Eamonn Bulfin: II "The walls were quite thin, and there was no bother breaking them. We reached
  as far as Price's [22 & 23], or O'Hanlon's [20-21] which was a fish shop. I remember the smells
  there. We spent Friday night barricading all the houses that we occupied by throwing down all
  the furniture from the rooms clearing all the rooms down the stairways into the bottom halls,
  blocking up the doorways".
- Liam Tannam: VII "When we got as far as Hanlon's Fish Shop I saw a number of our wounded lying about. They were quite cheerful although in some cases they were wounded through the lungs. There was one British soldier there, shot through the thigh, and he was moaning and groaning".
- Oscar Traynor: IV "Some time around this period I was sent for and asked to report to Commandant Pearse in Hanlon's fish shop in Moore St.; this was one of the buildings through which we had passed on our way up the street...It was from this building that Pearse eventually left to arrange the surrender. This was some time early on Saturday morning".

References to breaking through the walls of buildings along Moore Street during the evacuation feature heavily in many of the witness statements. According to Joe Good, the idea came from one of the young women sheltering in Cogan's (Good, 57). The technique of burrowing through walls had already been utilised by Republican detachments to the rear of the GPO and in positions on the far side of Sackville Street and had been recommended as a tactic by Connolly. Progress through the brick walls, in many cases a single stretcher thick, would have been rapid, although it appears only a single large crowbar was available (with one reference to there being a pick used in addition) (Shaffrey & Myles 2012, 54).

Opening up works and investigations carried out in 2012 by Franc Myles and Shaffrey Associates at 20/21 Moore Street did not reveal any evidence of blocked up openings. The report does state however that either the connections between the buildings already existed in 1916 thus making movement between the two building easy or an opening was made where one of the door openings is now positioned (2012, 14). This view is supported by the research carried out on the buildings by Dooley and Hall and Molloy Associates. Dooley and Hall state that Nos. 20 and 21 have operated as a single unit with interconnectivity between them since the turn of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, and in 1916 there was no need for the Irish Volunteers to tunnel between the two (Dooley & Hall, 2019, 19).

#### References:

Casey, C. (2005) The Buildings of Ireland, Dublin. Yale University Press.

Dooley, Terence & Hall, Donal Report (2019) Historical survey of the provenance of 10-25 Moore Street, Dublin c. 1901-1970. Report carried out for the Moore Street Advisory Group.

https://www.gov.ie/pdf/?file=https://assets.gov.ie/86217/815e932a-af22-434f-861a086ecd1bd673.pdf#page=null

DHLGH (2011). *Architectural Heritage Protection Guidelines for Planning Authorities*. Published by the Stationary Office, Dublin. https://www.buildingsofireland.ie/app/uploads/2019/10/ArchitecturalHeritage-Protection-Guidelines-

https://www.buildingsofireland.ie/app/uploads/2019/10/ArchitecturalHeritage-Protection-Guidelines-for-Planning-Authorities-2011.pdf

Dublin City Council (2001). O'Connell Street Architectural Conservation Area. Report by Dublin City Council. Molloy & Associates Conservation Architects (February 2021). Dublin Central Masterplan Area Conservation Plan. Report submitted with Planning Reference 2862/21.

Shaffrey Associates & Montague, J. (Nov 2005) *Architectural & Historical Assessment, No. 16 Moore Street, Dublin 1.* Unpublished Report for Dublin City Council.

Shaffrey Associates Architects & Franc Myles, Archaeology& Built Heritage (06 February 2012). *Application for Ministerial Consent to carry out Works at 14 – 17 Moore Street, Dublin 1, a National Monument.*Unpublished Report submitted to Department of Arts, Heritage and Gaeltacht in response to a Request for Additional Information; incl. the Battlefield Archaeological Assessment for Moore Street & Environs by Franc Myles.

## **NIAH Significance/Rating:**

The NIAH uses eight categories of special interest (architectural, historical, archaeological, artistic, cultural, scientific, technical & social) and identifies five categories of rating in seeking to rank buildings. The NIAH rating values are International, National, Regional, Local and Record Only (I, N, R, L, O). Structures which are considered of International, National, and Regional significance are deemed worthy of inclusion on the RPS.

The National Inventory of Architectural Heritage (NIAH) survey has been carried out for the area under Stage 1 of the Dublin Survey. 20/21 Moore Street was surveyed, but not recorded.

## Assessment of Special Interest under the Planning and Development Act 2000:

The Conservation Section considers 20/21 Moore Street, Dublin 1, to be of architectural, historical, cultural and social interest, as follows:

#### ARCHITECTURAL:

Number 20-21 is part of a terrace of multi-period buildings on the eastern side of Moore Street. Externally it presents as a modest commercial building, however, it was re-faced in the late 19<sup>th</sup>/early 20<sup>th</sup>, which disguises earlier 18<sup>th</sup> century buildings. Despite a history of alterations it still retains evidence of an 18<sup>th</sup> century roof form reflecting the street's 18<sup>th</sup> century origins. No. 21 retains corner fireplaces to upper floors and an early staircase. As an early surviving house in an area largely lost during the Rising, this example is of particular importance. Furthermore, the buildings are considered to contribute positively to the setting of the National Monument at No. 14-17 Moore Street.

#### HISTORICAL

The buildings were occupied by retreating rebel forces in 1916. No. 20/21 Moore Street formed part of the Moore Street HQ Block (10-25 Moore Street) which was occupied by the retreating rebel forces on the night and morning of the 28<sup>th</sup> and 29<sup>th</sup> of April 1916. It is considered to be of significant historic interest due to its association with the final days of the Easter Rising and is referred to a number of times in the accounts of the former combatants who remember spending the night there.

## **CULTURAL**

The structure's link to the 1916 Rising and the references to it in witness statements from the Volunteers involved, has acquired cultural significance in the intervening century. The *Architectural Heritage Protection Guidelines for Planning Authorities* state that special interest can be assigned to '...more modest works of the past that have acquired cultural significance with the passing of time.' (2011, 28). The 1916 Rising was a seminal event in Irish history that has understandably taken on cultural importance, and this, naturally, includes surviving elements of our architectural heritage that played a role in the events of that week.

#### SOCIAL

20/21 Moore Street is considered to be of social significance owing to its association with the Easter Rising evacuation route and the Moore Street HQ block. The building has significant interest as it was one of the last lines of refuge of the Irish Volunteers. The *Architectural Heritage Protection Guidelines for Planning Authorities* state that the characteristic of special social interest embraces those qualities for which a structure, a complex or an area has become a focus of ... political, symbolic or other sentiment to any group of people. A community may have an attachment to a place because it is an essential reference point for that community's identity, whether as a meeting place or a place of tradition, ritual or ceremony... This category of special interest may sometimes not be directly related to the physical fabric of a particular structure or structures and may survive physical alteration (2011, 30). The 1916 Easter Rising was a defining moment in Ireland's struggle for independence.

20/21 Moore Street, Dublin 1, would be considered of 'National' significance, on the basis of the NIAH significance/ratings above.

## **Conclusion:**

The Conservation Section concludes that the structures comprising 20/21 Moore Street, Dublin 1, merit inclusion on the Record of Protected Structures.

The extent of the proposed Protected Structure status and curtilage is outlined in Fig. 2 of this document (below).

It is now proposed to initiate the statutory process for the proposed addition of this structure to the Record of Protected Structures. This includes undertaking a statutory public consultation process in accordance with Section 55 of the Act. Following the statutory consultation process, a further report will be prepared taking any submissions and observations received into consideration, with a recommendation to the City Council to proceed or not with the proposed addition, or with a recommendation including amendments to the proposed addition.

#### Recommendation:

It is recommended that the statutory process to initiate the proposed addition of 20/21 Moore Street, Dublin 1, to the Record of Protected Structures, in accordance with Sections 54 and 55 of the Planning and Development Act, 2000 (as amended), be noted.

Recommendation		
Address	Description (to appear on RPS)	

20/21 Moore Street, Dublin	Commercial Premises
1	

The initiation of the statutory addition process was noted by the Central Area Committee of Dublin City Council at its monthly meeting held on 12<sup>th</sup> April 2022.

Paraic Fallon
Senior Planner, Conservation Section

Planning & Property Development Department Extent of Protected Structure Status

The extent of protected structure status & curtilage is shown on the map below in red.



Fig. 2: 20/21 Moore Street, Dublin 1: extent of Protected Sturcture status and curtilage outlined in red.

# **Photographs**



Figure 3: Front elevation



Figure 4: Rear of 20 Moore Street



Figure 5: Surviving dogleg, open string staircase Figure 6: Corner fireplace with continuous handrail.



# Aerial Image



Fig. 7: 20/21 Moore Street showing early roof form perpendicular to street with hipped sections to front and rear (Google Earth 04/12/20)

# **Historic Map**



Fig. 8: Extract from 1773 Map 'An Accurate Survey of the City and Suburbs of Dublin by Mr John Rocque with Additions and Improvements by Mr. Bernard Scale'. Nos. 20/21 Moore Street don't appear on Rocque's 1756 Map but do on this 1773 map. The street is shown as developed with No. 20 and 21 in place. No. 20 displays a closet return typical of the 18<sup>th</sup> century while No. 21 has none. Stable structures are shown to the rear of No. 20 delinterated by the black hatched buildings to the rear.