

Section 6: Archaeology

6.1 INTRODUCTION

The archaeological section of the Cultural Heritage & Conservation chapter was carried out by Rosanne Meenan, M.Litt., M.I.A.I. This section of the chapter will provide information and analysis of the potential impact of the proposed development on archaeological features within or in proximity to the development site.

6.2 STUDY METHODOLOGY

The site was visited on the 25th February 2010.

The following sources were consulted:

- Record of Monuments and Places, Dublin
- Historic mapping
- Local history sources

The assistance of staff in Dublin City Council, the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government and the National Museum of Ireland is gratefully acknowledged.

6.3 THE EXISTING RECEIVING ENVIRONMENT (BASELINE ENVIRONMENT)

6.3.1 Site Location

The development site, O'Devaney Gardens, is located in the area once identified as Grangegorman West townland and in the Civil Parish of Grangegorman. It lies east of Infirmary Road, south-east of the North Circular Road and west of the Oxmantown complex.

It is bordered on the east side by the grounds of St Bricin's Hospital and on the south side by housing which, in turn, is bordered on the south side by Montpellier Hill.

The site lies at a height of 26 metres above sea level; the ground slopes noticeably from this level down to the river Liffey.

6.3.2 Designations

The Record of Monuments and Places is a statutory listing of all the known archaeological monuments in the country. Monuments listed in it can comprise either individual sites or a complex of sites, sometimes making up an archaeological landscape. It is organised on a county-by-county basis. The monuments listed on it are afforded protection under the National Monuments Acts 1930-2004.

A large area of Dublin city centre has been designated as DU018-020. As well as covering the medieval core of the city, this designation covers the area to the north-east, the east and the south of the development lands. Lands south of the river Liffey, extending west to Islandbridge are also covered by the designation DU018-020.

The development site itself is not included within the area covered by DU018-020 and there are no recorded monuments to the north of the development site in the direction of Blackhorse Avenue and Cabra.

The closest individual monument to the development site is:-

DU018-020532 classified as 'dwelling'. In Montpelier Hill here, houses were first constructed in the 1720s.

The northwards extensions of both Aughrim St and Prussia St are included within the DU018-020 designation but there are no individual monuments listed within them.

The Phoenix Park has been designated as DU018-00701 'archaeological complex'. Individual monuments within this designation are as follows:-

- DU018-00709 classified as the 'present location' of a megalithic tomb, currently standing within the grounds of Dublin Zoo. While it is not completely certain, it appears that the stones originally came from the Knockmary tomb, near St. Mary's Hospital, which was excavated in the late 19th century.
- DU018-00708, classified as a well, and also located within the grounds of Dublin Zoo.
- DU018-00713 and DU018-00719 are located together at the site of a 17th century star-shaped fort and fort.
- DU018-00702 classified as a tower house. This is 'Ashtown Castle' and forms part of the Phoenix Park Visitors Centre.
- It is recorded that earthworks were observed in the area known as the 'Fifteen Acres' by the late Leo Swan while he was taking aerial photographs. They are recorded as three separate 'enclosures', DU018-007021, DU018-007022, DU018-007023. They are situated on high ground overlooking the Liffey, along the southern boundary of the Park.
- The grave of a woman containing Viking-style jewellery was found near the Wellington monument in the 1870s (www.phoenixpark.ie).

There are no recorded monuments on the footprint of the development site.

The Sites and Monuments Record for Dublin, when gathering data for the Record of Monuments and Places, consulted historic mapping, aerial photographs and other material in order to build up a picture of the potential for the survival of archaeology. If such material was observed on this site or in its vicinity, an SMR number would have been allocated. Therefore as no such number exists for the location of this site, it is reasonable to assume that no material was observed by the compilers of the Record.

There are no recorded features of industrial heritage importance.

The development site is not marked as a Zone of Archaeological Interest, nor as a Site of Archaeological Interest on the Dublin City Development Plan 2005-2011.

The land use here is zoned Z13 i.e. *To seek the social economic and physical rejuvenation* of this area.

In the Draft Dublin City Development Plan 2011 – 2017, the subject site is zoned Z14, the objective of which is to “*seek the social, economic and physical development and / or rejuvenation of an area with mixed use of which residential and 'Z6' would be the predominant uses*”.

6.3.3 Topographical Files and Acquisitions Database, National Museum of Ireland

Several artefacts are listed in the Acquisitions Database of the National Museum of Ireland as having been found in the Phoenix Park but there is no detailed information about their findspots.

They are as follows:

1866:Wk148	Iron mail
1937:3641	Bronze pin
1995:2000	Copper alloy pin
RIA1908:36	Bronze pin
RIA1916:37	Copper axehead
RIA1916:44	Bronze axehead.

Other objects are listed for the Phoenix Park in the database but they are associated with the burials at Knockmary. The list of finds above suggests a certain degree of activity in the area during prehistory, particularly during the Bronze Age.

6.3.4 Local history

The site lies to the west of the core of the medieval town which was situated on the south side of the river Liffey. There is increasing evidence for settlement on the north side of the river in both the Viking and Anglo-Norman periods (www.opw.ie; Cryerhall 2006; Purcell 2005).

The development site is located on land, which in medieval times was situated between the lands of the Knights Hospitallers of St John of Jerusalem at Kilmainham on the west side and the lands of St Mary's Abbey on the east side. By the seventeenth century, the lands currently occupied by the Phoenix Park had been sold to Sir Edward Fisher; the park was walled at the end of the 17th century. The present wall along Infirmary Road is on the same line as the 17th century wall and may incorporate elements of that wall.

It would appear that the land on which the development site is located may have formed part of the manor of Grangegorman which in Anglo-Norman times was in the ownership of the Priory of the Holy Trinity otherwise known as Christchurch, Dublin.

At the Dissolution the lands went to Sir Francis Agard; his descendant John was in ownership of the lands at the time of the rebellion in 1641.

The Civil Survey of 1654-56 recorded that Mr Agar was the proprietor of 800 acres in Grang Gorman (sic) of which 500 were in arable.

*The proprietor held ye premisses as his inheritan anno 1641
There is upon ye premisses an old stone house valued at 40li
(Simington 1945 179)*

Smithfield was developed in the 17th century and development spread north-westwards into Grangegorman through the late 17th and early 18th centuries. This area became built up in the 18th and 19th centuries with construction of military barracks and hospitals, the military prison today known as Arbour Hill, the Constabulary Barracks currently known as the Garda Depot and other elements of government administration.

Oxmantown as is known to day and which borders the development lands on the east side was laid out in the late 19th century although Oxmantown Green lay further to the east, marked on Rocque's map of 1756 as lying between the Royal Barracks and Smithfield and possibly extending even further at an earlier period.

6.3.5 Historic Mapping

Rocque's map of 1756 shows fields running back all the way from the Royal Barracks and Montpelier Hill all the way back to 'Black Horse Lane', the east end of which is today known as Aughrim St. A track or lane is marked running off Arbour Hill northwards to 'Black Horse Lane'. Nothing is marked here that might suggest survival of archaeological material in the fields.

William Duncan's map of 1821 does not show building on the fields but the Circular Road is marked.

The First Edition of 1836 shows open fields here apart from the spread of military hospitals and barracks buildings expanding northwards from the Royal Barracks. The 'Circular Road', known later as 'North Circular Road' is marked here. There is a suggestion that the same laneway as marked on Rocque's map is also shown here, some of the military buildings abutting the track/lane on their west side. A 'pump' is marked on the line of the lane.

Open fields are also marked on the Ordnance Map of 1876. Two of these fields opened out onto the North Circular road although rows of houses have been built on the east side of the road; the Oxmantown houses had not yet been built so that there is open ground to the east. The same lane seems to survive here with a small uncaptioned feature where the 'pump' was marked on the 1836 map. However it no longer runs up to Aughrim St but rather peters out into a field boundary.

The development site is still marked as open ground in the Ordnance Survey of 1948 although surrounded by buildings on all sides. The field boundaries are still marked. It appears that the construction of St Bricin's hospital in the early 20th century and the housing at St Bricin's Park may have interfered with the line of the lane although it may have survived in the lines of Thor Place and Cowper Street.

6.3.6 Previous archaeological work in the area

There is no record of archaeological work having been carried out on this site nor in the immediate vicinity.

In 2008, Dominic Delaney carried out testing at the site of an extension to the Ashling Hotel on Parkgate St; nothing of archaeological significance was found here (Dublin City Council archaeological archive).

Various testings carried out in Montpelier Hill during the second half of the 1990s revealed no archaeological material.

Monitoring was carried out by Franc Myles in 2007 at the site of the Courts of Criminal Justice on the corner of Infirmary Road. Much of the topography of this site had previously been disturbed. (Dublin City Council archaeological archive). Material was found there relating to the *Research and Production Plant* dating to 1942-7.

6.4 THE SUBJECT SITE

The development site was inspected in February 2010. It is occupied by a series of four-storey blocks of flats which were built in the 1950s. A number of these were recently demolished leaving flat open ground covered in grass. There are feeder roads around the estate leading to the blocks and to the parking areas. There is a playing ground in the middle of the estate.

There is a sense of separation from the surrounding residential areas. The southern portion of the estate is bounded on the east side by St Bricin's Hospital, owned by the Department of Defence. The latter has made available a strip of land to Dublin City Council for the purposes of this development. This lies along the western boundary of the Department of Defence lands, between St Bricins and O'Devaney Gardens. It is currently open ground and may indeed always have been open ground. Therefore it may never have been disturbed by earlier building, although it may have been landscaped as part of a formal garden to the west of the hospital. It is also possible that the area was disturbed in the past by the insertion of service trenches.

It is highly likely that construction of the flat complex in the 1950s involved major ground disturbance and removal of soil.

There is no record of archaeological material having been exposed during construction of the complex.

No archaeological material was observed during the February 2010 site inspection.

However it should be pointed out that although there is no designation for this area and although nothing was observed during the site visit, it is possible that archaeological material may have survived undetected under the surface in the strip of undisturbed land donated by the Department of Defence.

6.5 CHARACTERISTICS OF THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

A detailed description of the proposed development is set out in Chapter 2 of this EIS. The proposed development involves the demolition of the existing residential flat complexes, subject to a separate part 8 application, and the construction of new residential units and retail/commercial units at ground level.

The redevelopment of the site will be conducted in the following phased stages:

- | | |
|----------|--|
| Phase 1A | 110 residential units in four blocks A to D
Open Space Neighbourhood Park 4,680 sq.m. |
| Phase 1B | <u>Mixed Use Neighbourhood Centre</u>
1,090 sq.m. supermarket
790 sq.m. ancillary retail units
1,280 sq.m. community and office space
48 elderly housing units |
| Phase 2 | Option 1: 240 residential units
Option 2: 120 residential units, 8,000 commercial uses, public open space 1,100 sq.m. |

6.6 PREDICTED IMPACT OF THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

6.6.1 DO NOTHING IMPACT

If the proposed development does not take place there will be no negative impact on any archaeological material that might survive there.

6.6.2 PREDICTED IMPACTS OF PHASE 1A DEVELOPMENT

It is highly unlikely that the proposed development will have a negative impact on the recorded monuments described above as they are removed in the landscape from the development site.

Construction of the O'Devaney Gardens flats would have destroyed any archaeological material that might have survived up to the time of their construction.

A detailed assessment of the potential archaeological impact of future phases will take place as part of the application for permission for development of these future phases.

6.6.3 CUMULATIVE IMPACTS OF MASTERPLAN PROPOSALS

In accordance with Schedule 6, Part 2(c) of the Planning and Development Regulations 2001, this chapter has considered the cumulative impact of the proposed Phase 1A development in conjunction with future phases of

development. This relates to the cumulative impact on the subject site itself and on surrounding sites.

The European Commission's report of May 1999 'Guidelines for the Assessment of Indirect and Cumulative Impacts as well as Impact Interactions' defines cumulative impact as follows:

"Impacts that result from incremental changes caused by other past, present or reasonably foreseeable actions together with the project".

It is noted that the Scoping Response received from An Bord Pleanála indicates that:

"An assessment of the impact of Phase 1 within the Master Plan area, and the cumulative impact of Phase 1A, Phases 1B and 2 on the surrounding fringe areas bordering the master plan site, should be provided within the EIS".

Phase 1A of the proposed development comprises of:

- 110 residential units in four blocks A to D
- Open Space Neighbourhood Park 4,680 sq.m.

Future phases of development, which will be subject to separate applications for development envisage the following:

Phase 1B	<u>Mixed Use Neighbourhood Centre</u> 1,090 sq.m. supermarket 790 sq.m. ancillary retail units 1,280 sq.m. community and office space 48 elderly housing units
Phase 2	Option 1: 240 residential units Option 2: 120 residential units, 8,000 commercial uses, public open space 1,100 sq.m.

These figures are approximate and are subject to change as the Masterplan for the area progresses during future phases of development. The location of each Phase of development is indicated on the submitted Masterplan prepared by Dublin City Council.

With regard to the cumulative impact of proposed future phases on archaeological heritage, future phases of development will also take place on brownfield sites, apart from that strip of ground west of St Brigid's (phase 2) which appears not to have been developed in the past and which can be regarded as a green field site with possible archaeological potential.

Phases 1A and 1B will be located on those parts of the development lands which have been built over already and which have been disturbed in the past.

A detailed assessment of the potential archaeological impact of Phase 2 development will take place as part of the application for permission for

development of that phase. Phase 2 lands will include the strip of ground to the west of St Bricins, to be granted by the Department of Defence. Depending on the results of that assessment, suitable mitigation measures will be proposed.

6.7 MITIGATION MEASURES

As:-

- (i) The development site does not lie within an RMP area nor a zone of archaeological significance;
- (ii) There are no recorded monuments on the site;
- (iii) Study of historic mapping did not produce evidence to suggest the possible survival of archaeological material;
- (iv) Construction of the flat complex would have caused a great deal of ground disturbance, destroying archaeological material that might have survived up to the 1950s;

It is not recommended that archaeological testing or monitoring be carried out during reconstruction on the footprint of the O'Devaney Gardens flats. Should, however, anything of archaeological interest be found during ground disturbance, the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government, the National Museum and the City Archaeologist, Dublin City Council should be notified.

However, as the strip of land which has been handed over from the Department of Defence appears not to have been built over or disturbed in the past, it is recommended that an archaeological assessment, including test trenching, be carried out on that strip prior to commencement of development. As detailed in 6.6.3., a detailed assessment of that area will be carried when planning permission for Phase 2 is submitted. Full excavation may subsequently be necessary, depending on the recommendations of the planning authority and the Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government.

6.8 MONITORING

Once the development has been completed, including the resolution of any archaeological material that may have been exposed, there is no need for further monitoring of the project.

6.9 REINSTATEMENT

Not Applicable.

6.10 BIBLIOGRAPHY

Cryerhall, A 2006. Excavations at Hammond Lane, Dublin: from hurdle-ford to iron-foundry. 9-50. Ed. S. Duffy *Medieval Dublin VII*. Dublin

Purcell, E. 2005. The city and the suburb: medieval Dublin and Oxmantown.

Ed. S. Duffy *Medieval Dublin V1*. 188-223. Dublin

Simington, R.C. 1945. *The Civil Survey AD 1654-1658 Vol V11 County of Dublin*. Dublin



Plate 6.1 Blocks of flats O'Devaney Gardens



Plate 6.2 Strip of open ground. St Bricins to right of photo



Plate 6.3 View of flats. Looking north to housing in Oxmantown



Plate 6.4. Looking along main road through estate from North Circular Road end.
Sites of demolished blocks on either side

